

Assessing comparative terrestrial ecotoxicity of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, and Zn: The influence of aging and emission source

Owsianiak, Mikolaj; Holm, Peter E.; Fantke, Peter; Christiansen, Karen S.; Borggaard, Ole K.; Hauschild, Michael Zwicky

Published in: Environmental Pollution

Link to article, DOI: 10.1016/j.envpol.2015.07.025

Publication date: 2015

Document Version Peer reviewed version

Link back to DTU Orbit

Citation (APA):

Owsianiak, M., Holm, P. E., Fantke, P., Christiansen, K. S., Borggaard, O. K., & Hauschild, M. Z. (2015). Assessing comparative terrestrial ecotoxicity of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, and Zn: The influence of aging and emission source. *Environmental Pollution*, *206*, 400-410. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2015.07.025

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

1 **Citation:**

- Owsianiak, M., Holm, P., Fantke, P., Christiansen, K., Borggaard, O., Hauschild, M., 2015.
 Assessing comparative terrestrial ecotoxicity of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, and Zn: The influence of
- 4 aging and emission source. Environ. Pollut. 206, 400–410. doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2015.07.025

5	Assessing Comparative Terrestrial Ecotoxicity of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, and Zn: The Influence		
6	of Aging and Emission Source		
7			
8	Mikołaj Owsianiak ^{*,1} , Peter E. Holm ² , Peter Fantke ¹ , Karen S. Christiansen ² , Ole K. Borggaard ² ,		
9	Michael Z. Hauschild ¹		
10			
11	¹ Division for Quantitative Sustainability Assessment, Department of Management Engineering,		
12	Technical University of Denmark, Produktionstorvet, Building 424, DK-2800 Kgs. Lyngby,		
13	Denmark		
14			
15	² Department of Plant and Environmental Sciences, Faculty of Science, University of Copenhagen,		
16	Thorvaldsensvej 40, DK-1871 Frederiksberg C, Denmark		
17			
18	* corresponding author		
19	e-mail: <u>miow@dtu.dk</u>		
20	tel.: +45 4525 4805		
21			
22	Abstract		
23	Metal exposure to terrestrial organisms is influenced by the reactivity of the solid-phase metal pool.		
24	This reactivity is thought to depend on the type of emission source, on aging mechanisms that are		
25	active in the soil, and on ambient conditions. Our work shows, that when controlling for soil pH or		
26	soil organic carbon, emission source occasionally has an effect on reactivity of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb		
27	and Zn emitted from various anthropogenic sources followed by aging in the soil from a few years		
28	to two centuries. The uncertainties in estimating the age prevent definitive conclusions about the		
29	influence of aging time on the reactivity of metals from anthropogenic sources in soils. Thus, for		
30	calculating comparative toxicity potentials of man-made metal contaminations in soils, we		
31	recommend using time-horizon independent accessibility factors derived from source-specific		
32	reactive fractions.		
33			
34	Capsule abstract		
35	Improving current life cycle inventory (LCI) and life cycle impact assessment (LCIA) practice in		
36	terrestrial ecotoxicity assessment of metals.		

37

38 **1. Introduction**

39 Life cycle assessment (LCA) is used to quantify the potential environmental impacts of goods and

- 40 services (ISO, 2006). The life cycle inventory (LCI) phase of the LCA quantifies the flows of
- 41 resource consumptions and emissions that are associated with the good or service (e.g., the
- 42 generation of 1 kWh of electricity to the grid from a pulverized coal power plant), when considering
- 43 all the processes that are involved in the whole underlying life cycle. In the life cycle impact
- 44 assessment (LCIA) phase these input and output flows are translated into potential environmental
- 45 impacts using substance-specific characterization factors (CF) (Hauschild, 2005). CFs are also
- 46 referred to as comparative toxicity potentials (CTP) for those impacts that are related to chemical
- 47 pollution. CTPs should be seen as relative performance indicators and must ensure a fair
- 48 comparison between substances in terms of their potential impact on an ecosystem (Hauschild and
- 49 Huijbregts, 2015). In this paper, we address two limitations of the current LCI and LCIA practice of
- 50 terrestrial ecotoxicity assessment of metals, namely: (i) the reporting of anthropogenic metal
- 51 emissions based on their elemental content and oxidation stage, ignoring potentially relevant
- 52 information about the emission sources (e.g., deposition to soil of an airborne emission of a metal in 53 fly ash vs. direct emission to soil of a metal in a coal slag); and (ii) the disregarding aging of the 54 contamination in the calculation of the CTP values.

55 The CTP of a substance in soil is calculated as the product of three factors: (i) a fate factor, FF 56 (which expresses the resident mass of the substance in soil per unit of emission flow); (ii) an 57 exposure factor, XF (which represents the bioavailability of the substance to organisms in soil), and 58 (iii) an effect factor, EF (which describes the ecotoxicological impacts on the soil ecosystem) 59 (Henderson et al., 2011). In soils, apart from immediate bioavailability of a metal as influenced by 60 the metal speciation pattern in soil pore water, the potential for metal exposure also depends on the 61 metal's potential to undergo environmental processes (such as dissolution) from the solid phase 62 disposing it for uptake by biota and leaching to deep soil layers or runoff to surface water 63 (Owsianiak et al., 2013). This potential is referred to as accessibility and defined as "the mass 64 quantity of a chemical that is or can become available within a given time span and under given 65 conditions" (Reichenberg and Mayer, 2006). To take into account the influence of the accessible 66 metal pool in the soil, the XF of metals in soils has recently been defined as the product of an 67 accessibility factor, ACF (representing the accessible fraction of the total metal in the soil) and a 68 bioavailability factor, BF (that represents the fraction of the accessible metal in the soil that is 69 present in directly bioavailable, toxic forms) (Owsianiak et al., 2013).

70 The accessible metal pool is often approximated by "available" metal measured with diffusive 71 gradient in thin films) or by "reactive" metal (also called "labile" or "exchangeable") measured 72 with single or sequential extraction procedures (SEP) or isotope-based methods (Hamon et al., 73 2008, 2002; Harper et al., 1998; Rodrigues et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2004). Recently, Hamels et al. 74 (2014) showed that the isotopically exchangeable fraction of the total soil metal in field-75 contaminated soils explained lower toxicity of metals as compared with spiked soils. The term 76 "reactive" is based on the operational definition presented in Degryse et al. (2009) as metal in the 77 solid phase that "equilibrates with the solution phase within a few days". The reactive metal 78 typically includes outer-sphere and weakly bound inner-sphere complexes on mineral surfaces or 79 organic matter and should not be confused with the "chemically labile" metal (Sarret et al., 2004). 80 The latter may include strongly sorbed inner-sphere complexes which are chemically reactive, but 81 not necessarily available for solid-liquid partitioning within a time scale of days (Hamon et al., 82 2008). Reversible transformations between chemically labile (but often non-reactive) and reactive 83 metal pools can occur, implying that the size of the reactive fraction in soil can change with the 84 aging time. The reactivity of a metal in soil can vary depending on the anthropogenic source from 85 which it is emitted (Degryse et al., 2004; Roberts et al., 2002; Vespa et al., 2010) and furthermore it 86 can increase with time due to weathering (resulting in destruction of chemical bonds, most often 87 those between metal and oxygen) (Casey et al., 1993) or it can decrease with time due to fixation in 88 the soil through short- and long-term reactions with soil constituents (Buekers et al., 2008b; Crout 89 et al., 2006; Ma et al., 2013, 2006; Wendling et al., 2009).

90 To accommodate these potentially important influences on the metal ecotoxicity in LCA, some 91 modifications and further developments of the methodology are needed: (i) in the LCI phase, metal 92 emissions should be reported together with sufficient information to allow capturing the differences 93 that exist in reactivity between the various chemical forms that are present in the emissions from 94 different sources; (ii) in the LCIA phase, CTPs for the metal of interest have to be available that 95 match the information from the emission inventory and represent the ecotoxicity potential of the 96 different metal forms; and (iii) in the LCIA phase, such a set of CTPs for the metal of interest has to 97 consider metal aging in the soil, as influenced both by soil properties and by the aging pattern 98 exhibited by the different metal forms reported in the LCI phase.

99 The aim of our study is to present the methodology needed to improve current LCI and LCIA 100 practice in terrestrial ecotoxicity assessment of metals in soil, and to make it operational for the 101 metals Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, and Zn. We first present a conceptual aging model for metals in soils 102 and propose a framework for inclusion of aging in calculation of CTPs of metals in soils. In the 103 second part of the study, we determine the important factors for the reactivity of the six metals 104 (such as metal emission source, soil properties, aging time in the soil, and the rate of water

- 105 exchange on metal ions) based on empirical data from an extensive literature review, and show how
- 106 reactivity affects CTP of the studied metals. The empirical data represent particle-bound metal in
- 107 fly ashes, metal occluded in biosolids and other organic matrices, and metal released from mining
- 108 activities or industrial waste, which together constitute the major sources of anthropogenic metals in
- 109 soils (Nicholson et al., 2003). The age of the man-made metal contamination in many cases had to
- 110 be assumed and is therefore uncertain. Furthermore, the availability of measured data for some
- 111 potentially important soil properties, is limited. Therefore, insights into aging mechanisms had to be
- 112 gained by comparison with metal reactivity measured in soils spiked with soluble metal ion salts
- and soils contaminated with geogenic metal, and by comparison with predictions of existing kineticaging models and empirical regression models.
- 115

116 **2. Methods**

117 2.1. Definitions and Presentation of a Conceptual Aging Model for Metals in Soil

118 <u>Aging of a Metal in Soil</u> is defined as "change in solid-phase reactivity of a metal in soil over time".

- 119 This includes fixation that reduces metal reactivity (up to now referred to just as "aging" for soils
- 120 spiked with soluble salts), and weathering that potentially increases metal reactivity in soils.
- 121

122 <u>Time-Dependent Reactive Fraction of a Metal in Soil</u> (f_{reactive} , kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}) represents the 123 fraction of total metal in soil at that is available for solid-liquid partitioning within a time scale of 124 days as it varies with the aging time *t* (in years) of the metal in the soil (eq 1).

125
$$f_{\text{reactive}}(t) = \frac{C_{\text{reactive}}(t)}{C_{\text{total}}(t)} = \frac{s_{\text{reactive solid}}(t) + L/S \cdot c_{\text{total dissolved}}(t)}{s_{\text{total solid}}(t) + L/S \cdot c_{\text{total dissolved}}(t)} \quad \text{eq 1}$$

where $C_{\text{reactive}}(t)$ (kg_{reactive}/kg_{soil}) and $C_{\text{total}}(t)$ (kg_{total}/kg_{soil}) are the concentrations of reactive metal and total metal in soil at time *t* (year), respectively; $s_{\text{reactive solid}}(t)$ (kg_{reactive solid}/kg_{solid}) and $s_{\text{total solid}}(t)$ (kg_{total solid}/kg_{solid}) are the concentrations of reactive metal and total metal in the solid phase at time *t*, respectively; $c_{\text{total dissolved}}(t)$ (kg_{total dissolved}/L_{pore water}) is the concentration of total dissolved metal (assumed reactive) in soil pore water at time *t*; and *L/S* (L_{pore water}/kg_{soil}) is the ratio of pore water volume to soil mass.

132

133 Conceptual Aging Model for Metals in Soil. Figure 1 illustrates the temporal evolution of the

134 reactive fraction of a metal in a soil that is either spiked with readily soluble salt of the metal or is

135 contaminated with an anthropogenic non-reactive form of the metal. The evolution is predicted

using a three-compartment conceptual aging model, developed from a two-compartment model
presented by Crout et al. (2006). The model takes into account reversible, exchange between
reactive and nonreactive (but chemically labile) compartments, obeying first-order kinetics. In
addition, to capture long-term aging mechanisms, an additional irreversible first order exchange
between nonreactive (but chemically labile) and inert (chemically not labile) metal pools had been
incorporated (Amacher, 1991; Davis et al., 1994).

142 The model is conceptual as it does not take into account various processes that may alter the shape of reactivity curves, such as the possibility of biphasic exchange kinetics, the presence of 143 144 several metal pools with pool-specific exchange rate constants, very slow release of a metal from 145 the inert metal pool, or mobilization of strongly bound metal phases in plant rhizosphere in the 146 events of nutrient deficiency (Hinsinger, 2001). Yet, it allows us to illustrate how temporal 147 developments of the reactive fraction may depend on the form in which the metal is emitted and on 148 rate constants for the fixation and weathering reactions. The reactive fraction of a readily soluble 149 salt of the metal is initially (at time t_0) equal to 1, but it can be reduced due to fixation into soil 150 constituents (t_0 to t_1). This fixation mechanism occurs readily in spiked soils (Buekers et al., 2007; 151 Crout et al., 2006). In contrast, the reactive fraction of an anthropogenic emission of the metal is 152 expected to be lower initially (equal to 0 in the extreme case, as was assumed here), but can 153 increase due to weathering $(t_0 \text{ to } t_1)$ and then decrease due to fixation (after t_1). For example, 154 weathering of metal sulfides (CdS, CuS, or PbS) in mine tailings through oxidation and dissolution 155 of the primary sulfide increases reactive fraction initially; metals will form reactive outer-sphere 156 and weakly bound inner-sphere complexes on mineral surfaces or organic matter (Ribeta et al., 157 1995). If soil is limed to neutralize its acidity, however, metals will precipitate because of formation 158 of poorly-ordered (amorphous) oxides and/or carbonates that are not reactive. These poorly-ordered 159 minerals will over time change to well-ordered (crystalline) minerals that can be inert; time ranges 160 required to attain equilibrium for crystallization reactions in soils are in range of years to millennia 161 (Amacher, 1991; Sparks, 2000). The fixation of the non-reactive metal pool into the inert pool is 162 expected to further contribute to reduce the reactive fraction of anthropogenic metal at longer-time 163 scales (after t_1). On the other hand, if the soil is not limed, the reactive fraction is expected to 164 remain at a higher level as compared to limed soils (Ahnstrom and Parker, 2001; Li et al., 2014; 165 Nakhone and Young, 1993). If metal is occluded in solid particles (as e.g. ZnO in car tire debris), the solid phase matrix in which the metal is emitted may influence weathering kinetics by slowing 166 167 down metal release from the matrix (Rhodes et al., 2012; Smolders and Degryse, 2002) 168 We hypothesize that after a certain time t_1 long-term aging mechanisms will eventually lead to

formation of the same chemical forms in the soils, regardless of the initial emission source, and it

169

6

170 will no longer be possible to distinguish between metals from spiked and anthropogenic sources. 171 This time may be several hundreds or thousands of years, depending on the dominant aging 172 mechanisms and their rates. If metal forms in the soil at t_1 are the same regardless the initial 173 emission form of the metal, aging mechanisms that occur after t_1 will be the same. We also 174 hypothesize that as aging time goes toward infinite time, metal reactivity may become equal to the 175 reactivity of the metal constituting the geogenic background. This is because metal forms derived 176 from either initial form of the metal may over very long (sufficient) time end as the same as in the background and it will no longer be possible to distinguish whether the metal is geogenic or from an 177 178 anthropogenic emission. In practice, this situation may never be reached, as processes that influence 179 the ultimate fate of the soil such as erosion by surface water or glacial events, will also determine 180 the ultimate fate of metal present in the soil. However, Vespa et al. (2010) showed that Zn phyllosilicate species formed from smelter-related ZnS and ZnO were analogous to the native 181 182 phyllosilicate species which formed over time during pedogenesis.



183

Fig. 1. Left panel shows a three-compartment conceptual aging model for metals in soil; right panel shows predicted evolution of the reactive fraction ($f_{reactive}$, in kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}) of a metal in soil spiked with readily soluble metal salt assumed to be 100% reactive initially (black dashed lines), and in soil contaminated with metal from an anthropogenic source (red lines) assumed to be 100% nonreactive initially, shown against the background reactivity of geogenic metal. Predictions are shown for two sets of first order exchange rate constants for the fixation and weathering reactions (k_1 , k_2 and k_3 , in day⁻¹).

191

192 2.2. Framework for Inclusion of Aging in Calculation of Comparative Toxicity Potentials of Metals193 in Soils

- 194 <u>Time-Horizon Dependent Accessibility Factor of a Metal in Soil</u> (ACF^{T} , kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}) represents 195 the reactive fraction $f_{reactive}$ integrated over the metal's aging time t (in years) in the soil, from t=0 to 196 t=T (where T is the chosen time-horizon, in years) divided by the T (eq 2). This definition of the 197 ACF builds on that proposed earlier in Owsianiak et al. (2013) where ACF was assumed equal to
- 198 (time-independent) f_{reactive} and no time-horizon dependency of the ACF was considered.

$$ACF^{\mathrm{T}} = \frac{0}{T} \frac{1}{T} eq 2$$

200

199

201 Time-Dependent Distribution Coefficient between Total Solid Phase and Solution Phase

202 $(K_{d,total}(t), \text{ in } L_{pore water}/kg_{solid})$ is calculated from the time-dependent solid-phase reactivity of the 203 metal and its time-independent distribution coefficient between reactive solid phase and solution 204 phase $(K_{d,reactive}, \text{ in } L_{pore water}/kg_{solid})$ (eq 3). Because the amount of metal in solution $(L/S \cdot c_{pore water} \text{ in } eq 1)$ is usually very small in soils compared with the total metal concentration (Buekers et al., 206 2008a) this solid-phase reactivity can be approximated by $f_{reactive}$.

207
$$K_{d,total}(t) = K_{d,reactive} \cdot \frac{s_{total}(t)}{s_{reactive}(t)} \approx \frac{K_{d,reactive}}{f_{reactive}(t)}$$
 eq 3

208

209 <u>Time-Horizon Dependent Distribution Coefficient between Total Solid Phase and Solution Phase</u> (210 $K_{d,total}^{T}$, in L_{pore water}/kg_{solid}; eq 4) can be applied for calculating time-horizon dependent fate factors 211 (FF) to compensate for the fact that time-dependent partitioning is not considered in existing 212 multimedia fate models.

213
$$K_{d,total}^{T} \approx \frac{K_{d,reactive}}{ACF^{T}}$$
 eq 4

214 <u>Time-Horizon Dependent Comparative Toxicity Potential</u> (CTP_c^T , in m³/kg_{total emitted}·day; eq 5) of a 215 metal in soil after a unit emission to compartment *c* for the time horizon *T*, is calculated as 216 (Owsianiak et al., 2013):

 $217 \qquad CTP_c^T = FF_c^T \cdot ACF^T \cdot BF \quad \cdot EF \qquad \text{eq 5}$

where FF_c^T (in days) is the time-horizon dependent fate factor in soil calculated for total metal emitted to compartment *c* calculated using $K_{d,total}^T$ values; ACF^T (kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}) is the timehorizon dependent accessibility factor; *BF* (kg_{free}/kg_{reactive}) is the time-horizon independent bioavailability factor defined as the free ion fraction of the reactive metal in soil, and *EF* (m³/kg_{free}) is the time-horizon independent terrestrial ecotoxicity effect factor defined as potentially affected fraction (PAF) of species for the free ion form of the metal.⁴³

224 Metal aging will influence CTP of a metal through its control of both fate and accessibility. A reduction in reactive fraction increases $K_{d,total}^{T}$ and thereby the FF, because metal's residence time in 225 soil increases with an increase in $K_{d,total}^{T}$ (Owsianiak et al., 2013). This leads to increasing the CTP. 226 227 On the other hand, a reduction in reactive fraction reduces the ACF, which leads to decreasing the 228 CTP. These two effects only partly compensate each other, because metal fate in soil also depends 229 on the loss of the soil to surface water through soil erosion. The influence of metal aging on CTP is 230 expected to be higher for those metals, for which $K_{d,reactive}$ is high. To illustrate this, we compared 231 CTPs calculated for the infinite time horizon assuming reactive fraction equal to 1 kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}, 232 with the CTPs calculated for the ACFs derived from reactive fractions as determined in the current study (which were always below 1 kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}). The FFs were calculated employing USEtox 233 using $K_{d,total}$ values estimated from $K_{d,reactive}$ and the corresponding ACFs (eq 4), assuming default 234 235 values of 0.03 mm/yr for the soil erosion rate and 0.1 m for soil depth (Rosenbaum et al., 2008). 236 Details of the calculations are presented in Appendix 1, Section A5.

$$237 \qquad \frac{CTP_{ACF=f(f_{reactive})}}{CTP_{ACF=1}} = \frac{FF_{ACF=f(f_{reactive})} \cdot ACF_{ACF=f(f_{reactive})} \cdot BF \cdot EF}{FF_{ACF=1} \cdot 1 \cdot BF \cdot EF} = ACF_{ACF=f(f_{reactive})} \cdot \frac{FF_{ACF=f(f_{reactive})}}{FF_{ACF=1}} \quad \text{eq 6}$$

238

239 2.3. Data Collection and Treatment

240 Metals were included if data on reactive fraction for at least two different emission sources could be 241 found. We thus included Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb and Zn, and excluded Ag, Al and Fe (Collins and 242 Waite, 2009; Gabler et al., 1999; Settimio et al., 2014). Data for the three latter were, however, used 243 to see if our findings about factors controlling metal reactivity in soils apply also to other metals. 244 Data were retrieved from peer-reviewed studies available until April 2013 identified through 245 searching the ISI Web of Knowledge, version 5.7 (Thomson Reuters, New York, NY), using a 246 combination of keywords: (i) isotop*; and either (ii) exchang*, or dilute*; and either (iii) labil*, or 247 soil*; and either (iv) Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, Zn, cadm*, cobalt*, copp*, nick*, lead, or zinc*. A

248 complementary search was conducted in ISI to retrieve publications citing references retrieved in

249 the previous step, and those which were cited in the collected publications, but were not found 250 through the initial search in ISI. The two latter steps were iterated until no new data were found. A 251 study of Degryse et al. (2004) containing data on reactivity of various anthropogenic forms of Cd 252 and Zn is excluded and was used to compare our results with their findings, as is a recent study of 253 Marzouk et al. (2013) containing data on reactivity of anthropogenic forms of Cd, Pb and Zn that 254 was published after the searching had been done. Data were included if the following criteria were 255 met: (i) emission source was reported; (ii) reactive fraction or reactive concentration were measured in soils; and (iii) reactive fraction or reactive concentration were measured using isotope dilution 256 257 methods. The last criterion was applied to minimize uncertainties associated with the determination 258 of the concentration of reactive metal in soil; others showed the lack of correspondence between 259 metal fractions extracted using sequential extraction procedures and the size of reactive metal pool 260 measured using isotope-based methods (Ahnstrom and Parker, 2001). We combined methods that 261 measure either isotopically exchangeable (comprising reactive metal in the solid-phase only) or 262 isotopically available (comprising reactive metal both in the solid phase and in the soil solution) 263 pools to increase the number of data. This can introduce an error of >10% if soil sorption capacity is 264 low (Hamon et al., 2002). Details of harmonization of soil properties and descriptive statistics are 265 presented in Appendix A, Section A1.

266

<u>Classification of Emission Sources.</u> Data were first classified into three major categories: (i)
"spiked" for soils spiked with soluble salts; (ii) "anthropogenic" for soils contaminated with
primarily solid-phase metal of anthropogenic origin, excluding nanoparticles and massive products
such as Cu ingots which are outside the scope of this study; and (iii) "geogenic" for soils
contaminated with primarily solid-phase metal forms of geogenic origin.

272 Anthropogenic emissions that originate from similar processes or are similar with regard to the 273 composition of the matrix surrounding the metal in the emission are expected to have similar 274 chemical composition. For example, metal oxides are typically created during combustion processes 275 in power plants, smelters or incinerators, mining-related metal emissions can contain a large 276 proportion of metal sulfides, while metals found in biosolids or those found in wastewater are likely 277 to be found in association with organic carbon. It is thus hypothesized that statistically significant 278 differences in reactive fraction between these emissions source classess can be found. Therefore, 279 the "anthropogenic" category was further classified into four subcategories: (i) "airborne" including 280 emissions from smelters, metal refineries, factories, combustion of petrol, and unspecified 281 atmospheric deposition; (ii) "organic-related" including direct application of biosolids, manure, 282 compost, or wastewater irrigation; (iii) "mining and industrial waste" including emissions from

283 mine spoils, mining-affected sediment, material containing metal ores, alluvial deposition, 284 unspecified industrial waste, and technosols; and (iv) "other anthropogenic" including emissions 285 from ZnO (isolated or in tire debris), mixed anthropogenic sources, unspecified anthropogenic 286 sources, and dissolved metal forms of anthropogenic origin (such as Cd present as a co-contaminant 287 in phosphate fertilizer or Cu sulfate applied as a fungicide, or aqueous Zn dissolving from 288 galvanized power lines). It was assumed that if one emission source was given in the respective 289 publication, that source was the sole metal source in the soil. Mixed anthropogenic sources were 290 classified as other anthropogenic because no information could be retrieved about the dominant 291 metal source in the included soils. Note, that in contrast to many studies for readily soluble salts, 292 metal reactivity in anthropogenically contaminated soils cannot be attributed exclusively to 293 anthropogenic sources because reactivity of geogenic metal prior to anthropogenic input is not 294 known.

295

296 Estimation of Aging Time in Soil. A metal's aging time in soil (ideally) represents the time that the 297 metal has been in soil prior to the measurement of its reactivity. To get more insight into the 298 influence of contamination age on metal reactivity for anthropogenic sources, we often had to make 299 assumptions about the age by setting it equal to the time from the emission peak to the publication 300 year, or equal to half of the time interval between start and termination of the emission (if emission 301 peak was not reported). If an emission was reported to have occurred for more than or less than a 302 certain time period, contamination age was assumed equal to the starting date plus double or half 303 the length of that time period, respectively. If only a century of emission start was reported, time 304 from the middle of that century to publication year was assumed as the age. If the emission source 305 could be unambiguously identified, and information on contamination age could be retrieved from sources reporting emission data this information was used as the contamination age for that source. 306 307 Acknowledging the uncertainty in estimating the age, the anthropogenic contaminations were 308 classified into 5 age groups: (1) from 0 to 20 years; (2) from 20 to 50 years; (3) from 50 to 100 309 years; (4) from 100 to 150 years; and (5) from 150 to 220 years. Spiked soils, where aging time is 310 certain, were classified into 2 age groups: (I) from 0 to 0.5 years; and (II) from 0.5 to 2.5 years.

311

312 2.4. Analysis of Covariance (ANCOVA) and Wilcox Procedures

313 To increase the opportunity to find statistical significance of the effects of metal emission source on

314 reactive fraction while controlling for the effect of given soil property, we used one-way analysis of

315 covariance (ANCOVA), as explained in Appendix A, section A2. ANCOVA models were

316 expressed as ordinary least squares (OLS) regression models with the metal source term coded

317 employing the effect coding system and a given soil property being a covariate. If non-constant 318 variance related to the source term was identified, weighted least squares (WLS) regression was 319 employed with weights being based on the metal source. Models were developed for each soil 320 property separately. Logit-transformation of f_{reactive} was done when it improved normality of 321 distribution of the independent variable (in practice for all metals except of Cd), consistently with 322 the ANCOVA assumption, and was chosen among other transformation types as it an appropriate 323 transformation option for proportions. To identify where significant differences in (logit-324 transformed, apart from Cd) f_{reactive} between metal emission sources occur, ANCOVA was followed 325 by post-hoc multiple comparison tests based on the Tukey HDS method (employing the glht 326 function available in the R package multcomp) controlling for the soil property explaining the 327 largest part of the variance in the (logit-transformed, apart from Cd) $f_{\text{reactive.}}$ In cases where regression slopes were not homogeneous, the Wilcox modification of the Johnson-Neyman (J-N) 328 329 procedure was performed for pairwise comparisons as it allows identifying ranges of a soil property 330 where significant differences in metal reactivity between emission sources occur. Similarly, to test 331 for the effect of aging, pairwise comparisons between age groups for each anthropogenic source. 332 Comparisons were also made between anthropogenic sources and the two age groups for spiked 333 soils. OLS and WLS regression models were developed by R version 3.1.2 (R Core Team, Vienna, 334 Austria). The Wilcox procedure was executed using the program WILCOX.exe written by 335 Constable. Details of the analyses are presented in the Appendix A, Section A2.

336

337 **3. Results and discussion**

Below, we show how reactive fraction depends on emission source and aging time in the soil. We
also show how it relates to a metal-specific property, the metal's water exchange rate constant.
Implications of our findings for reporting and impact assessment of anthropogenic metal emissions,
are then discussed.

342

343 3.1. Does Emission Source Matter?

Figure 2 (left panel) shows the variability in the reactive fraction of the metals as influenced by metal source. One-way ANCOVA and WILCOX procedures revealed statistically significant differences between geogenic and various anthropogenic forms of Cd, Co, Cu and Zn (Table 1) when the covarying effects of soil pH or soil organic carbon are taken into account. Across these metals, anthropogenic sources generally have higher reactive fraction as compared to geogenic metals forms, apart from Cd where the opposite is the case. No differences were found between

- 350 geogenic and various anthropogenic sources for Ni and Pb. Between anthropogenic forms of Cd,
- 351 Co, Cu and Zn, statistically significant differences in the reactive fraction were found occasionally.
- 352 Again, no differences were found between anthropogenic sources for Ni and Pb.
- 353 A significant effect of anthropogenic metal source on reactive fraction of the studied metals 354 was not unexpected, particularly for Zn where the differences in reactive fraction were the most 355 apparent. Molina et al. (2013) showed that reactivity of Zn in pure-phase minerals and mine waste 356 varied between chemical forms of Zn. Also Degryse et al. (2011) showed that Zn layered double 357 hydroxide (Zn-LDH) and Zn in hydroxy-interlayered minerals (Zn-HIM), which are common forms 358 of Zn in soils, had relatively low reactivity compared to other common forms of Zn, such as zinc 359 carbonate $(ZnCO_3)$ and hydrozincite $(Zn_5(CO_3)_2(OH)_6)$. The differences in reactive fraction of 360 different forms of Zn can be explained by their differences in resistance to proton-promoted 361 dissolution. This is supported by the fact that we found a small negative effect of soil pH on 362 reactivity of Zn, and may suggest that the soils included contained forms of a metal that are are not 363 resistant to proton-promoted dissolution, such as Zn-LDH or carbonates, with relatively small 364 contribution of forms more resistant to proton-promoted dissolution, such as Zn-HIM (Degryse et 365 al., 2011; Khaokaew et al., 2012). Jacquat et al. (2009) showed that Zn in primary smelter minerals 366 accounted for only 5% of total Zn in the bulk soil.

367 In many cases we found no consistent effect of emission source on reactivity of other sources 368 and metals. This could be partly by explained by low number of data points for individual emission 369 sources, combined with limited information on potentially relevant soil parameters, such as content 370 of Al or Mn (hydr)oxides that were not available for all data points collected. Differences in 371 reactive fraction between metal sources due to differences in resistance to proton-promoted 372 dissolution of metal forms could be expected for other metals as well (Peltier et al., 2010; Voegelin and Kretzschmar, 2005), and we did find a small negative effect of soil pH on the reactivity of Cd, 373 374 Cu, and Pb. Yet, for Ni and Pb we did not find any differences between anthropogenic and geogenic 375 sources at all. This might be because metal forms in the emitted material either transform to forms 376 for which reactivity is close to the reactivity of the geogenic background, or transform to forms 377 constituting the geogenic background. Ettler et al. (2012) showed that dissolution of primary Pb 378 minerals (caracolite and K-Pb chloride) in a smelter fly ash led to formation of secondary anglesite, 379 minor Pb sulfate, and trace cerussite in soils, whereas about half of total Pb originating from mine 380 tailings and smelters was included in Fe- and Mn-(oxyhydr)oxides (Morin et al., 1999) which are 381 common geogenic forms of Pb (Teutsch et al., 1999). Published regression models developed for 382 soils contaminated with anthropogenic and/or geogenic metal generally predict reactive metal 383 concentrations within one order of magnitude around the measured values (see Appendix 1, Section

A4). Thus, the published models do not allow distinguishing between various anthropogenic
contamination forms as the error of prediction of the reactive fraction for the six studied metals
using any regression model is similar to the variability in the reactive fraction that is also within one
order of magnitude (see Appendix 1, Section A4). This supports our findings about some
difficulties to capture influence of contamination form on reactivity of anthropogenic metals in
soils.

390 Reactive fraction of Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn generally decreases with soil pH. Reactivity of Co and 391 Ni increases with an increase in organic carbon content of the soil but for Cd regression slopes are 392 not homogeneous; reactivity of organic-related Cd is significantly different from that measured for 393 both airborne and geogenic sources of Cd in acidic soils (pH<6.2) only (Table 1). These findings 394 are in agreement with Marzouk et al. (2013) who also found a negative effect of soil pH on 395 reactivity of Cd, Pb and Zn for a large set of 246 mining-impacted soils, and also in agreement with 396 Degryse et al. (2004) who found weak correlations between pH and reactive Zn in soils for a set of 397 74 soils contaminated with metals from various sources. By contrast, Degryse et al. (2004) did not 398 find any pH effect for Cd. We also found a small positive effect of soil organic carbon on reactivity 399 of Co and Ni. Differences in number of soils included for the different metals, combined with the 400 associated differences in property ranges between the soils in our data set may also explain why we 401 are not able to see any influence of organic carbon for Cd, Cu, Pb and Zn. Metals bound to organic 402 carbon are generally reactive in soils (Sarret et al., 2004), but soils spanning a rather wide range of 403 soil organic carbon content are needed to capture the relationship (Marzouk et al., 2013).

404

405 *3.2. Does Aging Matter?*

406 Figure 2 (right panel) shows the variability in the reactive fraction of the studied metals as 407 influenced by contamination age for the anthropogenic emission forms. There was no consistent 408 effect of aging in reactive fraction. There is a statistically significant difference between Pb aged for 409 100-150 years and Pb aged for 150-220 years (with the latter being more reactive), but there is no 410 statistically significant difference between airborne Cd aged for 20-50 years and airborne Cd aged 411 for 50-100 years. The difference between airborne Cd aged for 20-50 years and that aged for 50-100 412 years depends on soil pH, however, and there is no difference in the pH range 4.1 - 6.9. Due to 413 missing information about aging time for many data points for anthropogenic sources, statistical 414 comparison for other metals and sources was not possible.

415 Reactive fractions in spiked soils aged for up to 0.5 year were significantly higher than those 416 measured for geogenic and various anthropogenic sources, irrespective of the anthropogenic source 417 and its age (see Table 2 and Appendix A, Section A3). The difference in reactive fraction between 418 spiked soils aged for more than 0.5-2.5 years and anthropogenic sources was smaller, but remained 419 statistically significant for organic-related Cu and airborne Zn. This is probably because such short-420 term (< 2.5 years) experiments in spiked soils do not allow for occurrence of long-term aging 421 mechanisms, such as precipitation of salts or formation of non-reactive minerals of lower reactivity 422 (Amacher, 1991). This is in agreement with Ma et al. (2013), who showed how a kinetic aging 423 model overestimates reactivity of Ni in field-contaminated, agricultural and serpentine soils. By 424 contrast, the difference in reactive fraction between spiked soils aged for 0.5-2.5 years and 425 anthropogenic sources was not statistically significant for airborne Cd, other anthropogenic forms 426 of Cu, and organic-related Zn (see Table Ax and Figure Ay). For Cd, this reflects a rather high 427 reactivity of Cd in soils and can mainly be explained by the fact that Cd is mostly present in soil 428 solutions in dissolved forms as free ions or labile complexes which bind to soil constituents through 429 weak electrostatic forces (Rodrigues et al., 2010). Chrastny et al. (2012) and Nowack et al. (2010) 430 also reported higher amounts of weakly bound, reactive Cd in organic-rich soils contaminated with 431 Cd originating from a smelter. The other anthropogenic forms of Cu (being wood impregnate and a 432 fungicide) contained readily soluble Cu sulphate that had aged for several decades in field 433 condition, while some of soils spiked with Cu were leached. This may explain the lack of statistical 434 difference in the reactive fraction between these sources, as leaching is expected to reduce reactive 435 fraction in spiked aged soils as compared to non-leached aged soils (Ma et al., 2006). This may 436 suggest that in some cases aged spiked soils can be used to approximate reactive fraction for 437 anthropogenic metals. To test this, we systematically assessed the performance of published kinetic 438 aging models that were developed for soluble salts for prediction of reactivity for anthropogenic 439 contaminations in soils (see Appendix A, Section A4). The comparison of measured concentrations 440 of reactive metal and concentrations predicted by published kinetic aging models shows that even if 441 infinite aging time is assumed, the calculated bias (that is, mean of residuals) is positive, indicating 442 that the models overestimate reactive concentration (and thus reactive fraction) of anthropogenic 443 metals. This highlights the need for considering differences in metal reactivity between spiked soils 444 and man-made metal contaminations soils in characterization of metal accessibility in soils.





- 446 Fig. 2. Left panel: reactive fraction (*f*_{reactive}, in kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}) of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb and Zn measured in soils spiked
- 447 with soluble metal salts and in soils contaminated with various anthropogenic or geogenic metals; boxes with bars
- 448 indicate the 5th, 25th, 50th, 75th, and 95th percentiles and black dots indicate minimum and maximum values; numbers
- 449 of data points per emission source are shown above the boxes. Right panel: reactive fraction of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb and
- 450 Zn measured in soils spiked with soluble metal salts (black crosses) and in soils contaminated with various
- 451 anthropogenic metals (where all anthropogenic emission sources are combined; red circles) in relation to aging time in
- soil. Note, that the data presented are not corrected for geogenic background. Please see Table A1 and A2 for data
- 453 corrected for geogenic background that are available for some spiked soils.

- 454 Table 1. The analysis of the effects of metal source, soil properties, and aging on the reactive faction and proposed
- reactivity rankings based on pairwise Tukey HSD or WILCOX comparisons (please see Tables Ax and Ay for details). The 455
- 456 symbols < and > both indicate statistically significant difference between sources; \approx indicates either no statistically
- 457 significant difference or that comparison could not be done (because standardized residuals are related to the covariate or
- 458 because Q-Q plot for standardized residuals shows unacceptable deviations from 1:1 line); $\langle \approx \rangle$ indicate that statistical
- 459 significance and direction of the difference depend on soil pH (for Zn) or soil organic carbon (for Co) values.

F statistics for or	ne-way ANCOVA	Proposed reactivity ranking based on pairwise Tukey HSD and WILCOX	
models		comparisons	
Geogenic and anthropogenic sources irrespective of aging time: ¹			
Cadmium			
pH _{H2O}	F _{1,218} =22.7, p=3e-06	$m\&w \approx \text{ organic} \approx \text{ other } < \text{ airborne} \approx \text{geogenic}$	
Source	F _{4,218} =7.04, p=2e-05		
Source×pH _{H2}	F _{4,218} =4.87,		
0	p=0.0009		
Cobalt			
$\log_{10}(\text{OC})^4$	F _{1,23} =5.39, p=0.29	geogenic < airborne	
Source ⁴	F _{1,23} =6.03, p=3e-5		
Copper ⁴			
pH _{H2O} ⁴	F _{1,181} =33.6, p=3e-8	geogenic \approx organic < other	
Source ⁴	$F_{2.181}=34.5$, p=2e-13		
Nickel			
$\log_{10}(OC)^{5}$	F _{2.85} =12.7, p=0.0006	geogenic \approx m&w \approx airborne	
Lead	• /** •		
pH _{H2O} ⁵	F _{1.66} =67.2, p=1e-11	geogenic \approx m&w \approx airborne \approx other	
Zinc			
pH _{H2O} ⁴	F _{1.171} =67.2, p=1e-11	geogenic $<$ airborne $<$ other \approx organic	
Source ⁴	$F_{3,171}=14.2, p=3e-8$		
Spiked soils and anthropogenic sources as influenced by aging time: ²			
aging time for spiked soils: I (0-0.5 yr); II (0.5-2.5 yr)			
aging time for anthropogenic sources: 1 (0-20 yr); 2 (20-50 yr); 3 (50-100 yr); 4 (100-150 yr); 5 (150-220 yr)			
Cadmium			
models were no	t developed	airborne(3) \approx airborne(2) \approx spiked(II) $< \approx$ > spiked(I)	
Cobalt			
models were no	t developed	airborne(2) $\langle \approx \rangle$ spiked(I) not corrected	
Copper			
models were no	t developed	organic(1) < spiked(II) < spiked(I)	
	-	other(3) \approx spiked(II) < spiked(I)	
Nickel			
models were no	t developed	airborne(2) < spiked(I)	
Lead			
models were no	t developed	$airborne(2) \approx airborne(1) < spiked(I)$	
	-	m&w(4) < m&w(5) < spiked(I)	
Zinc			
models were no	t developed	airborne(3) $< \approx >$ airborne(2) $<$ spiked(II) \approx spiked(I)	
	*	other(1) \approx spiked(II) \approx spiked(I)	

460

¹ m&w, organic and other represent the "mining and industrial waste", "organic-related" and "other anthropogenic" metal 461 sources, respectively

462 ² soils spiked with Co and Pb are not corrected for geogenic background due insufficient number of data points for which 463 such correction could be done to make the comparison possible.

464 3.3. Metal Reactivity In Relation to the Intrinsic Kinetic Lability of Metal Ions

465 According to the conceptual aging model presented in Fig. 1, the size of reactive fraction depends on the exchange rate constants for the fixation and weathering reactions. The fixation rate constants 466 467 are mainly determined by soil pH (Buekers et al., 2008b; Crout et al., 2006; Ma et al., 2013, 2006; 468 Wendling et al., 2009). However, while the pH can also influence weathering kinetics, the weathering rate constants are expected to be mainly determined by the kinetic lability of metal ions 469 470 as it determines the speed of a metal to undergo substitution reaction and thus desorption from the 471 solid phase (Martell, 1978). Laird et al. (2011) already showed that metal bioaccessibility for 472 gastrointestinal uptake from contaminated soils was related to a metal-specific property, the water 473 exchange rate constant on metal aqua complexes (k_{H2O}), whereas Owsianiak et al. (2014) showed 474 that a parameter related to the $k_{\rm H2O}$ was related to metal absorption efficiency in terrestrial worms 475 exposed to aged soil contaminations. In this study, the $k_{\rm H2O}$ can explain 63 and 49% of variability in 476 average (geometric mean) reactive fraction of anthropogenic and geogenic metal forms, 477 respectively (Fig. 3). Because the mechanism by which a cation leaves a dissolving mineral surface 478 is similar to the mechanisms of water exchange in the hydrated complex, the observed relation is 479 expected to hold for those metals and contamination forms, for which the major chemical bond in 480 the contamination material is that between metal and oxygen (Casey and Westrich, 1992; Casey et al., 1993; Ludwig et al., 1996; Pokrovsky and Schott, 2002). Indeed, the average reactive fraction of 481 anthropogenic or geogenic Fe^{3+} and Cr^{3+} in soils agrees with predictions of the two reactivity – 482 lability relationships if extrapolated outside the six studied metals (Fig. 3). We thus suggest that 483 484 regression models based on k_{H2O} and can be developed to estimate reactive fraction for metals 485 which form metal-oxygen bonds in soils. Their performance could potentially be improved by 486 taking into account molecular diffusion of a metal ion along surface site in the soil, which could be 487 related to acidity constants or radii of the metal ions (Axe and Anderson, 1997; Bruemmer et al., 488 1988). By contrast, any relationship based on $k_{\rm H2O}$ is not expected to hold for metals, which do not 489 tend to form metal-oxygen bonds in soils. Indeed, the average reactivity of Ag measured by 490 Settimio et al. (2014) in soils spiked with soluble Ag salt aged for up to 6 months was smaller (from 50 to nearly 0%) than reactivity that could be expected based on the very large (>1×10¹⁰), 491 492 unmeasurable k_{H2O} of Ag⁺. This can be explained by the fact that the dominant forms of Ag in their 493 soils were Ag bonded with S species, AgCl, and metallic Ag.



494

495 Fig 3. Relation between log_{10} -transformed water exchange rate constant for metal aqua complexes, 496 $k_{\rm H2O}$ (in 1/s) and logit-transformed, average (geometric mean) reactive fraction, $f_{\rm reactive}$ (in 497 kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}) of Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, and Zn measured in soils contaminated with anthropogenic 498 forms of the metals (white dots and solid line) and geogenic metals (black squares and dashed line). Red triangles show reactive fraction measured by Gabler et al. (1999) for Cr³⁺; and reactive fraction 499 estimated for Fe³⁺ based on the data presented in Collins and Waite (2009) (averaged across 21 500 samples of an iron-rich acid sulfate soil, assuming that $C_{\text{total}} = 0.05 \text{ kg}_{\text{total}}/\text{kg}_{\text{soil}}$, which is in lower 501 502 range of expected values; Richard Collins, personal communication). The $k_{\rm H2O}$ for metal ions were from Helm and Merbach (1999) except of Pb^{2+} , which was not available in the latter study, and was 503 504 from Martell (1978).

505

506 3.4. Implications for Inventory Analysis and Reporting for Anthropogenic Metal Emissions

507 In current inventory practice of LCA and chemical hazard assessment, emissions of metals are 508 reported as the element and its oxidation state (Pettersen and Hertwich, 2008; Pizzol et al., 2011) 509 However, for four out of six metals we found statistically significant effect of the metal source on 510 the reactive fraction, which suggests that for cationic metals the current practive may be insufficient 511 to support the characterization of bioavailability and terrestrial toxicity. Therefore, to eliminate the 512 potential error associated with using emission source-independent ACFs in calculation of CTP 513 values of metals in soils, we propose that inventory procedures for metal emissions, such as applied 514 in the LCI analysis phase of an LCA, should provide information about the metal emission source if 515 that source is known. The proposed classification of emission sources into archetypes based on their expected differences in metal reactivities, may be used as guidance. The classification offers a 516 517 compromise between on the one hand the unrealistic option of creating inventories of each chemical species within a metal source (that would then have to be matched with metal species-specific
CTPs), and on the other hand the currently prevailing practice of completely ignoring differences in
the ACF (and thus CTP) between emission sources.

521

522 3.5. Implications for Impact Assessment of Metals on Terrestrial Environments

523 Our results suggest that at time scales of decades to centuries, the influence of aging on reactivity 524 for anthropogenic metal sources is difficult to capture and is statistically uncertain. Thus, for 525 calculating CTPs of cationic metals in soils we recommend using time-horizon independent ACFs 526 derived from time-independent reactive fractions, combined with FFs calculated using time-horizon independent K_d^{total} values. If the emission source is known, ACFs should be derived from source-527 528 specific reactive fractions. If the emission source is unknown, ACFs can be derived from the 529 geometric mean of the reactive fraction measured across all geogenic and anthropogenic 530 contaminations in the study. Such a time-horizon independent ACF it is in practice equal to the 531 (time-independent) reactive fraction and can be derived from values presented in Tables A1 and A2.

532 The implications of considering differences in reactive fraction on both fate and accessibity of 533 the metals at the CTP level are presented in Fig. 4. For the metals Pb and Cu, the reduction in the 534 CTP correlates almost linearly with the reduction in reactive fraction. These two metals are so 535 strongly associated with the solid phase of the soil that their fate (residence time) in the soil is 536 determined mainly by removal together with the solid phase, and this translates directly into the 537 CTP (see eq 5). The CTP of Co and Ni is also reduced when reactive fraction decreases, particularly 538 for the values below 0.5 kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}, whereas for Zn the reactive fraction is only important in the lower range of values (< 0.2 kg_{reactive}/kg_{total}). For these metals, both leaching and erosion determine 539 540 metal residence time in soils, and a decrease in ACF can partly be compensated by an increase in 541 the FF. For Cd, a reduction in the reactive fraction (and thus ACF) has no influence on the CTP 542 because its fate is determined primarily by leaching and a decrease in ACF is fully compensated by 543 an increase in the FF. Note, that a USEtox-default value of 0.03 mm/yr was assumed for the soil 544 erosion rate in calculation of fate factors. This value lies within the wide range of values determined 545 for various soils (Montgomery, 2007), and implies that about 3300 years are required for a 10-cm 546 top soil layer to exchange completely as a result of erosion and run-off loss to surface water. As 547 many metals have strong affinity to soil constituents, this removal process is important in the 548 overall fate, and further research should focus on providing solid data for soil erosion rates under 549 different environmental conditions.

550 551



552

Fig. 4. Influence of the accessibility factor (ACF), as determined by the size of reactive fraction (f_{reactive}), on the comparative toxicity potential (CTP) of anthropogenic Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, and Zn in soils. Black solid and dashed lines represent three hypothetical cases for metals with $K_{d,\text{reactive}}$ equal to (i) 10; (ii) 1,000; and (iii) 100,000 L_{pore water}/kg_{soil}.

557

558 *3.6. Limitations*

559 The data set for anthropogenic sources is limited to contaminations aged for up to two centuries, 560 and furthermore there is uncertainty in estimating the age. In the typically infinite time perspective 561 applied in LCIA, aging processes may gain more importance by strengthening the binding of the 562 metal in the soil and reducing its reactivity.. Considering the effort put into the literature search, it is 563 questionable, however, whether a better data set can be compiled from the open literature, so it is 564 not likely that such an aging effect can be demonstrated in this way. An alternative approach could 565 be based on a repeated sampling experiment over centuries, but this is also not straight forward. On the other hand, in the assessment of CTPs for use in LCIA, the residence time of the metal in the 566 567 soil may be restricted by the residence time of the soil solids in the soil compartment of the fate 568 model, in which case even the aging over very long time perspectives will have small influence on 569 the CTP values

Studies on metal reactivity in soils for other metals are scarce, which makes the estimation of
reactive fraction, or any reactivity-age relationship, for the other metals virtually impossible.
Reactive fraction could be potentially predicted using a structure-reactivity relationship, as
demonstrated in this study for Cr and Fe. Alternatively, our conceptual aging model can be used to

574 determine shape of reactivity curve, provided that fixation and weathering rate constants are either

575 measured or predicted for dominant soil minerals (Bearup et al., 2012; Brantley, 2008). A

576 problematic issue is the estimation of the fixation rate constant between the inert and nonreactive

577 (but chemically labile) metal pools, as is the potential for very slow release of metal from the inert

- 578 pool that is not considered in our model and that may occur for some slowly-reacting minerals
- 579 (Degryse et al., 2009).
- 580

581 **4. Conclusions**

582

583 We occasionally found the effect of the emission source on the solid-phase reactivity of the studied 584 metals. The effect of contamination age in soil was not apparent, but the uncertainties in estimating 585 the age do not allow drawing definite conclusions about the influence of aging time on the reactivity 586 of anthropogenic metal sources in soils. We therefore recommend including the effect of the 587 emission source and disregarding the role of aging in assessment of comparative terrestrial toxicity 588 of anthropogenic Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb and Zn. Our framework for including aging in calculation of 589 fate and accessibility factors of metals in soils can, however, be used if aging is found to play a role 590 in reactivity of other anthropogenic metals in terrestrial systems and if reactivity-age relationship 591 can be estimated.

592

593 Appendix A. Supplementary data

594 Supplementary data related to this article can be found at http://dx.doi.org/

595

596 Acknowledgements

We thank all reviewers for their constructive comments on this and earlier versions of the
manuscript. This research was funded by the European Commission under the FP7 program;
ENV.2009.3.3.2.1: LC-IMPACT. The scholarship support by the 3R graduate school at DTU
Environment is acknowledged.

601

602 **5. References**

- Ahnstrom, Z.A.S., Parker, D.R., 2001. Cadmium reactivity in metal-contaminated soils using a
 coupled stable isotope dilution-sequential extraction procedure. Environ. Sci. Technol. 35,
 121–126. doi:10.1021/as0013500
- Amacher, M., 1991. Methods for obtaining and analyzing kinetic data, in: Sparks, D.L., Suarez,
 D.L. (Eds.), Rates of Soil Chemical Processes . Soil Science Society of America, Madison,
 WI, pp. 19–59.
- Axe, L., Anderson, P., 1997. Experimental and Theoretical Diffusivities of Cd and Sr in Hydrous
 Ferric Oxide. J. Colloid Interface Sci. 185, 436–48. doi:10.1006/jcis.1996.4635
- Bearup, L.A., Navarre-Sitchler, A.K., Maxwell, R.M., McCray, J.E., 2012. Kinetic Metal Release
 from Competing Processes in Aquifers. Environ. Sci. Technol. 46, 6539–6547.
 doi:10.1021/es203586y
- Brantley, S.L., 2008. Kinetics of Mineral Dissolution, in: Brantley, S.L., Kubicki, J.D., White, A.F.
 (Eds.), Kinetics of Water-Rock Interaction. Springer New York, pp. 151–210.
 doi:10.1007/978-0-387-73563-4 5
- BRUEMMER, G.W., GERTH, J., TILLER, K.G., 1988. Reaction kinetics of the adsorption and
 desorption of nickel, zinc and cadmium by goethite. I. Adsorption and diffusion of metals. J.
 Soil Sci. 39, 37–52. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2389.1988.tb01192.x
- Buekers, J., Amery, F., Maes, A., Smolders, E., 2008a. Long-term reactions of Ni, Zn and Cd with
 iron oxyhydroxides depend on crystallinity and structure and on metal concentrations. Eur. J.
 Soil Sci. 59, 706–715. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2389.2008.01028.x
- Buekers, J., Degryse, F., Maes, A., Smolders, E., 2008b. Modelling the effects of ageing on Cd, Zn,
 Ni and Cu solubility in soils using an assemblage model. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 59, 1160–1170.
 doi:10.1111/j.1365-2389.2008.01053.x
- Buekers, J., Van Laer, L., Amery, F., Van Buggenhout, S., Maes, A., Smolders, E., 2007. Role of
 soil constituents in fixation of soluble Zn, Cu, Ni and Cd added to soils. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 58,
 1514–1524. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2389.2007.00958.x
- Casey, W.H., Banfield, J.F., Westrich, H.R., McLaughlin, L., 1993. What do dissolution
 experiments tell us about natural weathering? Chem. Geol. 105, 1–15.
 doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0009-2541(93)90115-Y
- 632 Casey, W.H., Westrich, H.R., 1992. Control of dissolution rates of orthosilicate minerals by
 633 divalent metal oxygen bonds. Nature 355, 157–159. doi:10.1038/355157a0
- 634 Chrastny, V., Vanek, A., Komarek, M., Farkas, J., Drabek, O., Vokurkova, P., Nemcova, J., 2012.
 635 Incubation of air-pollution-control residues from secondary Pb smelter in deciduous and
 636 coniferous organic soil horizons: Leachability of lead, cadmium and zinc. J. Hazard. Mater.
 637 209, 40–47. doi:10.1016/j.jhazmat.2011.12.072

- Collins, R.N., Waite, T.D., 2009. Isotopically Exchangeable Concentrations of Elements Having
 Multiple Oxidation States: The Case of Fe(II)/Fe(III) Isotope Self-Exchange in Coastal
 Lowland Acid Sulfate Soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 43, 5365–5370. doi:10.1021/es900190p
- 641 Crout, N.M.J., Tye, A.M., Zhang, H., McGrath, S.P., Young, S.D., 2006. Kinetics of metal fixation
 642 in soils: Measurement and modeling by isotopic dilution. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 25, 659–
 643 663. doi:10.1897/05-069r.1
- Davis, A., Ruby, M. V., Bergstrom, P.D., 1994. Factors controlling lead bioavailability in the Butte
 mining district, Montana, USA. Environ. Geochem. Health 16-16, 147–157.
 doi:10.1007/BF01747911
- Degryse, F., Buekers, J., Smolders, E., 2004. Radio-labile cadmium and zinc in soils as affected by
 pH and source of contamination. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 55, 113–121. doi:10.1046/j.13652389.2003.00554.x
- Degryse, F., Smolders, E., Parker, D.R., 2009. Partitioning of metals (Cd, Co, Cu, Ni, Pb, Zn) in
 soils: concepts, methodologies, prediction and applications a review. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 60,
 590–612. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2389.2009.01142.x
- Degryse, F., Voegelin, A., Jacquat, O., Kretzschmar, R., Smolders, E., 2011. Characterization of
 zinc in contaminated soils: complementary insights from isotopic exchange, batch extractions
 and XAFS spectroscopy. Eur. J. Soil Sci. 62, 318–330. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2389.2010.01332.x
- Ettler, V., Mihaljevič, M., Šebek, O., Matys Grygar, T., Klementová, M., 2012. Experimental in
 Situ Transformation of Pb Smelter Fly Ash in Acidic Soils. Environ. Sci. Technol.
 doi:10.1021/es301474v
- Gabler, H.E., Bahr, A., Mieke, B., 1999. Determination of the interchangeable heavy-metal fraction
 in soils by isotope dilution mass spectrometry. Fresenius J. Anal. Chem. 365, 409–414.
 doi:10.1007/s002160051632
- Hamels, F., Malevé, J., Sonnet, P., Kleja, D.B., Smolders, E., 2014. Phytotoxicity of trace metals in
 spiked and field-contaminated soils: Linking soil extractable metals with toxicity. Environ.
 Toxicol. Chem. 33, n/a–n/a. doi:10.1002/etc.2693
- Hamon, R.E., Bertrand, I., McLaughlin, M.J., 2002. Use and abuse of isotopic exchange data in soil
 chemistry. Aust. J. Soil Res. 40, 1371–1381. doi:10.1071/sr02046
- Hamon, R.E., Parker, D.R., Lombi, E., 2008. Advances inisotopic dilution techniques in trace
 element research: a review of methodologies, benefits, and limitations, in: Sparks, D.L. (Ed.),
 Advances in Agronomy, Vol 99. pp. 289–343. doi:10.1016/s0065-2113(08)00406-9
- Harper, M.P., Davison, W., Zhang, H., Tych, W., 1998. Kinetics of metal exchange between solids
 and solutions in sediments and soils interpreted from DGT measured fluxes. Geochim.
 Cosmochim. Acta 62, 2757–2770. doi:10.1016/s0016-7037(98)00186-0

- Hauschild, M.Z., 2005. Assessing environmental impacts in a life-cycle perspective. Environ. Sci.
 Technol. 39, 81A–88A.
- Hauschild, M.Z., Huijbregts, M.A.J., 2015. Life cycle impact assessment. doi:10.1007/BF02978760
- Helm, L., Merbach, a. E., 1999. Water exchange on metal ions: experiments and simulations.
 Coord. Chem. Rev. 187, 151–181. doi:10.1016/S0010-8545(99)90232-1
- Henderson, A., Hauschild, M., van de Meent, D., Huijbregts, M., Larsen, H., Margni, M., McKone,
 T., Payet, J., Rosenbaum, R., Jolliet, O., 2011. USEtox fate and ecotoxicity factors for
 comparative assessment of toxic emissions in life cycle analysis: sensitivity to key chemical
 properties. Int. J. Life Cycle Assess. 16, 701–709. doi:10.1007/s11367-011-0294-6
- Hinsinger, P., 2001. Bioavailibility of soil inorganic P in the rhizosphere as effected by root induced chemical changes: a review. Plant Soil 237, 173–195.

ISO, n.d. ISO 14044:2006 Environmental management—life cycle assessment—requirements and
 guidelines. International Standards Organization.

- Jacquat, O., Voegelin, A., Kretzschmar, R., 2009. Soil properties controlling Zn speciation and
 fractionation in contaminated soils. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 73, 5256–5272.
 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2009.05.066
- Khaokaew, S., Landrot, G., Chaney, R.L., Pandya, K., Sparks, D.L., 2012. Speciation and release
 kinetics of zinc in contaminated paddy soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 46, 3957–63.
 doi:10.1021/es204007t
- Laird, B.D., Peak, D., Siciliano, S.D., 2011. Bioaccessibility of Metal Cations in Soil Is Linearly
 Related to Its Water Exchange Rate Constant. Environ. Sci. Technol. 45, 4139–4144.
 doi:10.1021/es103710a
- Li, L., Holm, P.E., Marcussen, H., Bruun Hansen, H.C., 2014. Release of cadmium, copper and lead
 from urban soils of Copenhagen. Environ. Pollut. 187, 90–97.
 doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2013.12.016
- Ludwig, C., Devidal, J.L., Casey, W.H., 1996. The effect of different functional groups on the
 ligand-promoted dissolution of NiO and other oxide minerals. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 60,
 213–224. doi:10.1016/0016-7037(95)00394-0
- Ma, Y., Lombi, E., McLaughlin, M.J., Oliver, I.W., Nolan, A.L., Oorts, K., Smolders, E., 2013.
 Aging of nickel added to soils as predicted by soil pH and time. Chemosphere 92, 962–8.
 doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.03.013
- Ma, Y.B., Lombi, E., Oliver, I.W., Nolan, A.L., McLaughlin, M.J., 2006. Long-term aging of
 copper added to soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 40, 6310–6317. doi:10.1021/es060306r
- 706 Martell, A.E., 1978. Coordination chemistry. Van Nostrand Reinhold.

- Marzouk, E.R., Chenery, S.R., Young, S.D., 2013. Predicting the solubility and lability of Zn, Cd,
 and Pb in soils from a minespoil-contaminated catchment by stable isotopic exchange.
 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 123, 1–16. doi:10.1016/j.gca.2013.09.004
- Molina, R.M., Schaider, L. a, Donaghey, T.C., Shine, J.P., Brain, J.D., 2013. Mineralogy affects
 geoavailability, bioaccessibility and bioavailability of zinc. Environ. Pollut. 182, 217–24.
 doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2013.07.013
- Montgomery, D.R., 2007. Soil erosion and agricultural sustainability. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 104,
 13268–13272. doi:10.1073/pnas.0611508104
- Morin, G., Ostergren, J.D., Juillot, F., Ildefonse, P., Calas, G., Brown, G.E., 1999. XAFS
 determination of the chemical form of lead in smelter-contaminated soils and mine tailings:
 Importance of adsorption processes. Am. Mineral. 84, 420–434.
- Nakhone, L.N., Young, S.D., 1993. THE SIGNIFICANCE OF (RADIO-) LABILE CADMIUM
 POOLS IN SOIL. Environ. Pollut. 82, 73–77. doi:10.1016/0269-7491(93)90164-j
- Nicholson, F.A., Smith, S.R., Alloway, B.J., Carlton-Smith, C., Chambers, B.J., 2003. An inventory
 of heavy metals inputs to agricultural soils in England and Wales. Sci. Total Environ. 311,
 205–219. doi:10.1016/s0048-9697(03)00139-6
- Nowack, B., Schulin, R., Luster, J., 2010. Metal fractionation in a contaminated soil after
 reforestation: Temporal changes versus spatial variability. Environ. Pollut. 158, 3272–3278.
 doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2010.07.020
- Owsianiak, M., Rosenbaum, R.K., Huijbregts, M.A.J., Hauschild, M.Z., 2013. Addressing
 geographic variability in the comparative toxicity potential of copper and nickel in soils.
 Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 3241–3250.
- Owsianiak, M., Veltman, K., Hauschild, M.Z., Hendriks, a. J., Steinmann, Z.J.N., Huijbregts, M. a.
 J., 2014. Elucidating differences in metal absorption efficiencies between terrestrial softbodied and aquatic species. Chemosphere 112, 487–495.
 doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.05.024
- Peltier, E., Lelie, D. Van Der, Sparks, D.L., 2010. Formation and stability of Ni-Al hydroxide
 phases in soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44, 302–8. doi:10.1021/es902332b
- Pettersen, J., Hertwich, E.G., 2008. Critical review: Life-cycle inventory procedures for long-term
 release of metals. Environ. Sci. Technol. 42, 4639–4647. doi:10.1021/es702170v
- Pizzol, M., Christensen, P., Schmidt, J., Thomsen, M., 2011. Eco-toxicological impact of "metals"
 on the aquatic and terrestrial ecosystem: A comparison between eight different methodologies
 for Life Cycle Impact Assessment (LCIA). J. Clean. Prod. 19, 687–698.
- Pokrovsky, O.S., Schott, J., 2002. Surface Chemistry and Dissolution Kinetics of Divalent Metal
 Carbonates. Environ. Sci. Technol. 36, 426–432. doi:10.1021/es010925u

- Reichenberg, F., Mayer, P., 2006. Two complementary sides of bioavailability: Accessibility and
 chemical activity of organic contaminants in sediments and soils. Environ. Toxicol. Chem. 25,
 1239–1245. doi:10.1897/05-458r.1
- Rhodes, E.P., Ren, Z., Mays, D.C., 2012. Zinc leaching from tire crumb rubber. Environ. Sci.
 Technol. 46, 12856–63. doi:10.1021/es3024379
- Ribeta, I., Ptacek, C.J., Blowes, D.W., Jambor, J.L., 1995. The potential for metal release by
 reductive dissolution of weathered mine tailings. J. Contam. Hydrol. 17, 239–273.
 doi:10.1016/0169-7722(94)00010-F
- Roberts, D.R., Scheinost, A.C., Sparks, D.L., 2002. Zinc speciation in a smelter-contaminated soil
 profile using bulk and microspectroscopic techniques. Environ. Sci. Technol. 36, 1742–1750.
 doi:10.1021/es015516c
- Rodrigues, S.M., Henriques, B., da Silva, E.F., Pereira, M.E., Duarte, A.C., Romkens, P., 2010.
 Evaluation of an approach for the characterization of reactive and available pools of twenty
 potentially toxic elements in soils: Part I The role of key soil properties in the variation of
 contaminants' reactivity. Chemosphere 81, 1549–1559.
 doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2010.07.026
- /5/ doi:10.1016/j.chemosphere.2010.0/.026
- Rosenbaum, R.K., Bachmann, T.M., Gold, L.S., Huijbregts, M.A.J., Jolliet, O., Juraske, R.,
 Koehler, A., Larsen, H.F., MacLeod, M., Margni, M., McKone, T.E., Payet, J., Schuhmacher,
 M., van de Meent, D., Hauschild, M.Z., 2008. USEtox-the UNEP-SETAC toxicity model:
 recommended characterisation factors for human toxicity and freshwater ecotoxicity in life
 cycle impact assessment. Int. J. Life Cycle Assess. 13, 532–546. doi:10.1007/s11367-0080038-4
- Sarret, G., Balesdent, J., Bouziri, L., Garnier, J.M., Marcus, M.A., Geoffroy, N., Panfili, F.,
 Manceau, A., 2004. Zn speciation in the organic horizon of a contaminated soil by micro-x-ray
 fluorescence, micro- and powder-EXAFS spectroscopy, and isotopic dilution. Environ. Sci.
 Technol. 38, 2792–2801. doi:10.1021/es035171t
- Settimio, L., McLaughlin, M.J., Kirby, J.K., Langdon, K. a., Lombi, E., Donner, E., Scheckel, K.G.,
 2014. Fate and lability of silver in soils: Effect of ageing. Environ. Pollut. 191, 151–157.
 doi:10.1016/j.envpol.2014.04.030
- Smolders, E., Degryse, F., 2002. Fate and effect of zinc from tire debris in soil. Environ. Sci.
 Technol. 36, 3706–3710. doi:10.1021/es025567p
- Sparks, D.L., 2000. New frontiers in elucidating the kinetics and mechanisms of metal and
 oxyanion sorption at the soil mineral/water interface. J. Plant Nutr. Soil Sci. Fur
 Pflanzenernahrung Und Bodenkd. 163, 563–570. doi:10.1002/15222624(200012)163:6<563::aid-jpln563>3.0.co;2-0
- Teutsch, N., Erel, Y., Halicz, L., Chadwick, O.A., 1999. The influence of rainfall on metal
 concentration and behavior in the soil. Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 63, 3499–3511.
 doi:10.1016/s0016-7037(99)00152-0

Vespa, M., Lanson, M., Manceau, A., 2010. Natural Attenuation of Zinc Pollution in Smelter Affected Soil. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44, 7814–7820. doi:10.1021/es101567u

Voegelin, A., Kretzschmar, R., 2005. Formation and dissolution of single and mixed Zn and Ni
 precipitates in soil: evidence from column experiments and extended X-ray absorption fine
 structure spectroscopy. Environ. Sci. Technol. 39, 5311–8.

- Wendling, L.A., Ma, Y.B., Kirby, J.K., McLaughlin, M.J., 2009. A Predictive Model of the Effects
 of Aging on Cobalt Fate and Behavior in Soil. Environ. Sci. Technol. 43, 135–141.
 doi:10.1021/es801322r
- 788 Zhang, H., Lombi, E., Smolders, E., McGrath, S., 2004. Kinetics of Zn Release in Soils and
- 789 Prediction of Zn Concentration in Plants Using Diffusive Gradients in Thin Films. Environ.
- 790 Sci. Technol. 38, 3608–3613. doi:10.1021/es0352597

791

Graphical abstract



Highlights

- we found an effect of source on reactivity of anthropogenic metals in soils
- the influence of aging on reactivity of anthropogenic metals was not consistent
- we recommend including source and disregarding aging in calculation of CTPs values