

# Advanced electrochemical investigations of niobium modified $Li_2ZnTi_3O_8$ lithium ion battery anode materials

Firdous, Naila; Arshad, Nasima; Simonsen, Søren Bredmose; Kadirvelayutham, Prasanna; Norby, Poul

Published in: Journal of Power Sources

Link to article, DOI: 10.1016/j.jpowsour.2020.228186

Publication date: 2020

Document Version Peer reviewed version

Link back to DTU Orbit

Citation (APA):

Firdous, N., Arshad, N., Simonsen, S. B., Kadirvelayutham, P., & Norby, P. (2020). Advanced electrochemical investigations of niobium modified Li ZnTi O lithium ion battery anode materials. *Journal of Power Sources*, 462, Article 228186. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpowsour.2020.228186

#### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Advanced electrochemical investigations of niobium modified Li<sub>2</sub>ZnTi<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub> lithium ion battery anode materials

Naila Firdous<sup>a,b</sup>, Nasima Arshad<sup>a\*</sup> Søren Bredmose Simonsen<sup>b</sup>, Prasanna Kadirvelayutham<sup>b</sup> and Poul Norby <sup>b\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Chemistry, Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad 44000, Pakistan.

<sup>b</sup>Department of Energy Conversion and Storage, Technical University of Denmark, Frederiksborgvej 399, P.O. Box 49, Roskilde DK-4000, Denmark

\*Corresponding author.

E-mail address: \*Correspondence: nasimaa2006@yahoo.com;

Institutional: <u>nasima.arshad@aiou.edu.pk</u>

Co-corresponding author:

E-mail address: pnor@dtu.dk

## ABSTRACT

Li<sub>2</sub>ZnTi<sub>3-x</sub>Nb<sub>x</sub>O<sub>8</sub> (x=0, 0.05, 0.1) (LZTNO) materials ae synthesized through ball milling assisted solid state synthesis and its structural, morphological and electrochemical investigations are carried out. All LZTNO samples have a spinel type structure with space group P4<sub>3</sub>32 and small amounts of anatase TiO<sub>2</sub> were also found in doped samples. The structure and mechanism of electrochemical reaction of Li<sub>2</sub>ZnTi<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub> (LZTO) is not changed or disturbed significantly with introduction of small amount of Nb<sup>+5</sup> dopant. All samples show a uniform size distribution but Li<sub>2</sub>ZnTi<sub>2.95</sub>Nb<sub>0.05</sub>O<sub>8</sub> (LZTNO-05) display less agglomeration and more uniform size distribution. Also, the LZTNO-05 sample exhibit low charge transfer resistance and higher reversibility. Galvanostatic charge-discharge revealed that LZTNO-05 has highest discharge capacities of 223.9, 211, 173.7, 140, 83.7 mAh g<sup>-1</sup> at different C-rates

0.1C, 0.2C, 1C, 2C, and 5C, respectively. Pristine LZTO shows smaller discharge capacities of 197, 184, 146, 129.8 and 68.9 mAh g<sup>-1</sup> at 0.1C, 0.2C, 1C, 2C and 5C rates, respectively. LZTNO-05 is prepared by a cost-effective route with excellent electrochemical properties making it more attractive as potential anode electrode for commercialization.

Keywords: Doping; Lithium ion battery; anode material; agglomeration; ball milling

## 1. Introduction

In order to satisfy environment protection issue and to combat increased energy demand to ensure sustainable development of the world it is vital to develop renewable and clean energy systems. For this purpose, in 1990 Sony introduced lithium ion batteries (LIBs). In portable electric devices, hybrid electric vehicles (HEVs), Plug in hybrid electric vehicles (PHEVs), electric vehicles (EVs) lithium ion batteries are used as a promising technology due to small volume changes, long cycle life, high energy density, light weight, no memory effect and high voltage [1]. In commercial lithium ion batteries graphite is used as anode which has high capacity (372 mAh g<sup>-1</sup>), is inexpensive, have high specific capacity and is chemically inert. Graphite containing anode materials intercalate lithium at very low potential close to lithium plating which causes growth of lithium dendrites which is a safety risk and as a result short circuiting of batteries can take place. So, there is a continuous investigation for alternative materials which have high safety and cost effectiveness. Titanium based materials offer such properties i.e. safety and stability [2-6]. Researchers are interested in developing new anode materials for lithium ion batteries due to the increased demand of energy density and power density for lithium ion batteries. Recently a titanium containing class of compounds Li<sub>2</sub>MTi<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub> (M= Ni, Zn, Mg, Co) attracted attention due to its higher theoretical capacity and stability [5, 7, 8]. Introduction of Zn in the cubic spinel type structure ( $Li_2ZnTi_3O_8$ ) results in a two-step discharge process with voltage plateaus at  $\sim 1$ V and  $\sim 0.5$ V and a charge plateau at  $\sim 1.5$ V. The material show good thermal and structural stability also in full cells [9-14]. Three Ti<sup>4+</sup> are present in the structure of LZTO, so according to theoretical studies they can be converted to  $3\text{Ti}^{3+}$  and the material will offer a theoretical capacity of 227 mAh g<sup>-1</sup> [15]. The LZTO insertion and de-insertion, the reaction can be shown in the following equation [16].

$$Li_2ZnTi_3O_8 + 3Li^+ + 3e_- \rightarrow Li_5ZnTi_3O_8$$

Structural reports of LZTO reveal that its space group is  $P4_332$  and its cell parameters are a = b = c = 8.35596(2) Å [17].

However, LZTO exhibits low conductivity and the lithium diffusion coefficient is also low due to which its practical applications are limited. These properties can be enhanced by formulation with other conductive phases, designing different morphology [18, 19], surface modification by coating [20-22], doping and nanosizing [19]. Doping with elements like Ce<sup>+4</sup> [23], V<sup>+5</sup> [24], Fe<sup>+3</sup> [25], Cu<sup>+2</sup> [26], Mo<sup>+6</sup> [27], Zr<sup>+4</sup> [20], Ag<sup>+1</sup> [28], Na<sup>+</sup> [17] and Ti<sup>+3</sup> [29] resulted in enhanced electrochemical performance of LZTO. Selection of a suitable element for doping has a significant role in order to improve overall performance of an electrode material. In order to improve the electronic conductivity of titanium-based materials doping with high valence ions like Nb<sup>+5</sup> is very effective also to stabilize their structure. Selection of niobium is principally based on the fact that ionic radius of Nb<sup>+5</sup> and Ti<sup>+4</sup> are very close so this substitution will not very difficult, secondly introduction of Nb<sup>+5</sup> in crystal lattice of LZTO can increase its electronic conductivity significantly by increasing concentration of electrons. It also improves the cyclic performance and capacity [30]. LZTO can be synthesized by many synthetic methods i.e., solid state synthesis [31], molten salt method [15], sol gel synthesis [4, 32-34] etc. The present research is focused on cost effective ball milling assisted solid state synthesis of LZTO and its Nb<sup>+5</sup> doped analogues for fast charging discharging and as a potential candidate for commercial lithium ion batteries.[20]

#### 2. Experimental

#### 2.1. Materials and synthesis

Ball milling assisted solid state method is used to synthesize (Li<sub>2</sub>ZnTi<sub>3-x</sub>Nb<sub>x</sub>O<sub>8</sub>, x=0, 0.05, 0.1). Stoichiometric amount of following raw materials were taken anatase TiO<sub>2</sub> (Aldrich 99.8%), Zn(CH<sub>3</sub>COO)<sub>2</sub>.2H<sub>2</sub>O (Fluka 99%), Li<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub> (Alfa Aesar 99%) and Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> (Sigma Aldrich 99.9%). All raw materials are mixed and ball milled in ethanol for three hours at a speed of 100rpm and the resulting mixture was dried overnight in an oven at 120 °C in air. The obtained material was ground and sintered for 6 h at 800 °C with a ramp rate of 3 °C per minute, cooled to room temperature then the powder was again ground with pestle and mortar to get LZTNO (x = 0, 0.05, 0.1) final powders.

## 2.2. Electrode preparation

Electrode slurries were prepared by mixing the active material, super P conductive carbon (Timcal C65) and polyvinylidene fluoride (PVDF Kynar) as binder with 80:10:10 wt.% ratio and dispersing it in N- methyl-2-pyrrolidone (NMP Sigma Aldrich 99.5%). The slurry was coated on copper foil with the help of doctor blade technique. The loading of active material was 3-3.5 mgcm<sup>-2</sup>. The coating was dried and then roll pressed. Electrodes of 15 mm diameter were punched and dried overnight in a vacuum oven in the glove box. Coin cells CR2032 were assembled using lithium foil as counter and reference and the punched electrode on copper foil as working electrode. A 1 M solution of LiPF<sub>6</sub> in a 1:1 volume ratio ethylene carbonate (EC): dimethyl carbonate (DMC) was used as electrolyte. The level of oxygen and water in the glove box was less than 0.1 ppm.

#### 2.3. Physical Characterization

Crystal structure studies and material identification was carried out using X-ray diffraction (XRD) on a Rigaku SmartLab diffractometer (Bragg Brentano geometry, Cu-Kα radiation, 10-

90 degrees in 2theta, step size 0.02 degrees in 2theta). Rietveld refinement was performed using the FullProf software suite. For morphology studies and particle size analysis scanning electron microscopy (SEM Zeiss Ultra) was used. Raman spectroscopy was carried out at 532 nm laser excitation at ambient temperature with Raman spectrometer (Renishaw inVia Spectrometer). Transmission electron microscopy (TEM), selected area electron diffraction and energy dispersive spectroscopy (EDS) were performed by using a JEOL 3000F equipped with a field emission gun operated at 300 kV and an Oxford instruments EDS detector. The specimens were prepared for TEM adding a dispersion of sample powders in ethanol to a standard TEM Cu grid with a holey carbon support film. Quantifications of the EDS spectra were performed with calculated k-factors from the INCA software. High-resolution TEM (HRTEM) images recorded analyzed with the Crystal Match software [35]. Here at least three independent measurements, two lattice distances and the angle between the planes were compared to theoretical values described in crystallographic information files (CIF). Crystals are found to be consistent with a structure of all three measurements agree with the theoretical values within estimated measurement errors of 10% for distances and 5% for angles.

## 2.4 Electrochemical measurements

Electrochemical measurements of LZTNO were performed using a Biologic VMP3 multichannel potentiostat and data were analyzed using the ECLAB software. The measurements include cyclic voltammetry (CV) in the range of 0.05-3 volts with scan rate 0.5 mV s<sup>-1</sup>, electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) was carried out with AC amplitude of 5 mV in frequency range of 0.01 Hz-10 kHz and charging discharging tests of cells at different C-rates in voltage range between 0.05 V and 3 V were carried out.

## 2.5 Preliminary in situ diffraction studies

*In situ* XRD experiments were performed on a Rigaku Smartlab diffractometer in reflection geometry using a modified EL-Cell (ECC-OPTO) in situ battery cell. A 7 mm diameter pellet

of LZTNO with a thickness of ca. 250 micrometer was pressed from scraped-off coated electrode material. The cell was assembled in a glovebox using a lithium foil as the negative electrode and the same electrolyte (1M LiPF<sub>6</sub> in 1:1 EC/DMC) as for the electrochemical characterization. Diffraction data were collected from 10-130 degrees in 2theta using a step size of 0.0152 degrees in 2theta. The collection time for each XRD pattern was 32 minutes.

## 3. Results and discussion

#### 3.1. Struture and morphology

The XRD pattern of the LZTNO samples are shown in Fig. 1(a). The main diffraction peaks of all materials match diffraction peaks of LZTO having space group P4<sub>3</sub>32 (JCPDS# 86 1512). In order to understand the crystal structure in detail Rietvield refinement was carried out, Fig. 2S. The refinements show that in this spinel structure 12d and 8b sites are occupied by Li and Ti, and Zn and Li share crystallographic 8c sites. However, in case of higher amount of niobium impurity peaks also appear which are attributed to anatase  $TiO_2$ . Here no niobium containing impurity phase appeared in the analysis which confirms that all of the Nb<sup>+5</sup> has entered into the crystal lattice of the doped LZTNO. By doping on titanium (Ti<sup>+</sup>) site of LZTO with higher valence and larger Nb<sup>+5</sup> ions reasonably its conductivity enhances because of increase in electron concentration [36]. TiO<sub>2</sub> is also an active electrode material having fast insertion extraction and high insertion potential (2V vs Li/Li<sup>+</sup>) due to which it is also used as composite with Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub>. The capacity of titanium-based electrode materials for lithium ion batteries has been shown to improve in the presence of small amount of TiO<sub>2</sub> [37, 38]. Li<sub>2</sub>ZnTi<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub>/TiO<sub>2</sub> composite anode materials synthesized by co-precipitation showed excellent cycling performance with high rate capacity [39]. This could partially explain the increase in capacity and cycling capability for LZTNO-05 where an appreciable amount of TiO<sub>2</sub> is present. In Fig. 1(b) the strongest diffraction peak (311) is enlarged to show the difference in peak position. The small shift in peak position of the doped materials towards lower angle reflects

the change in lattice parameters. It indicated that the spinel structure of  $Li_2ZnTi_3O_8$  did not change significantly with Nb-doping, but a slight increase in the cubic unit cell parameter with doping was observed Fig. 1(c) Table S1. The change is small and may be due to the larger ionic radius of Nb<sup>+5</sup> (0.64 Å) compared to Ti<sup>+4</sup> (0.605 Å) or it may be a result of charge compensation reduction of some Ti<sup>+4</sup> to Ti<sup>+3</sup> (0.67 Å). In previous studies it can be observed that when the niobium content is small than the decrease in lattice parameters appears because in this case other parameters dominate [40-42]. But when the content of niobium exceeds 1% then the lattice parameters of doped materials increase as compared to pristine LZTO. Increment in the amount of niobium results in increase in Ti<sup>+3</sup> increasing electronic conductivity. Niobium content enhances the stability of the LZTNO during repeated insertion / deinsertion reaction of Li<sup>+</sup> because of the fact that Nb-O bond is very stronger as compared to Ti-O bond [43].



**Fig. 1. (a)** XRD pattern (b) enlarged (311) diffraction peak, (c) Unit cell parameter a (Å) on the basis of Rietveld refinement and (d) Raman spectra of LZTNO

Raman spectra of the LZTNO materials in the range of 200 to 800 cm<sup>-1</sup> are shown in Fig. 1(d). Main peaks are observed at 233, 263, 353, 402, 443, 522, 613, 665, and 717 (719) cm<sup>-1</sup>. LZTNO shows peak at 402 cm<sup>-1</sup> due to vibrational mode of Zn-O symmetric stretching and Li-O bonds of tetrahedral LiO<sub>4</sub> show stretching vibrations at 443cm<sup>-1</sup> [44]. Due to the A<sub>1</sub>g mode of tetrahedral ZnO<sub>4</sub> strongest peak is observed at 402cm<sup>-1</sup> [45]. In the TiO<sub>6</sub> octahedral groups Ti-O bond shows a symmetric stretch at high frequency band 717 cm<sup>-1</sup> whereas in case of doped materials a shift towards high frequency that is 719 cm<sup>-1</sup> is observed because cation oxygen bonding is enhanced due to niobium doping [33]. Reports reveal that conductivity decrease with increased sharpness of A1g mode of compounds like Li<sub>x</sub>Mn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> (0.1< x < 2.0) [46]. In case of increased FWHM (full width half maximum) of A<sub>1</sub>g mode an increase of conductivity can be observed. Present studies of LZTNO-05 reveal an increase in FWHM (wider) as compared to (LZTO), so higher electronic conductivity can be expected from LZTNO-05.



Fig. 2. SEM images of LZTNO (a) x = 0, (b) x = 0.05, (c) x = 0.1

SEM micrographs of the samples show no marked changes in morphology of pristine and doped samples of LZTNO (x = 0, 0.05, 0.1) materials. All the samples have irregular particles some of which aggregate together with no obvious difference in morphology under magnification of 2 µm. However, Nb doping has an obvious effect on size distribution and as

a result LZTO possess a wide particle size distribution and conspicuous agglomeration as compared to LZTNO-05 which is showing a narrow particle size distribution and less agglomeration[30]. In the crystal lattice of the LZTNO-05 presence of varied niobium prevents the overgrowth of crystals which results in decreased particle size through doping [47-49]. Nb doping results in narrow particle size distribution [50]. These micrographs show that sample with x = 0.05 shows good dispersion, uniform particle size and less agglomeration as compared to the other samples. Maybe it could result in adequate contact between the electrode and electrolyte resulting in easier Li<sup>+</sup> diffusion and electron transport.



**Fig. 3.** (a-c) TEM images, (d-f) SAED pattern and (g-i) HRTEM images are presented for LZTNO, x = 0 (a,d,g), 0.05 (b,e,h), 0.1 (c,f,i). Measured lattice distances are indicated at the HRTEM images.

Fig. 3. (a-c) presents representative TEM images of LZTNO x=0, 0.05 and 0.1, respectively. According to the images, the particle morphologies are comparable for all three materials.

The presence of Ti, Zn, O and Nb is confirmed with EDS, Fig. 1S, while energies of the characteristic peak from Li are too low to be measured with EDS. SAED results from LZTNO, x=0 (d), 0.05 (e), 0.1 (f) are presented in fig. 3(d-f). The patterns are consistent with relatively large crystal sizes as (as observed in a-c) since the typical ring pattern observed for powders are broken up into separated spots. Analysis of a rotational integral of the patterns show consistency with the cubic LZTO (Space-group 212, P 43 3 2) for all three materials. Measurements from at least three HRTEM images of each material show that the observed crystal structures for all three materials are consistent with the crystal structure of LZTO (space group P 4<sub>3</sub> 3 2). Examples of HRTEM images from LZTNO x=0 (g), 0.05 (h), 0.1 (i) are presented in fig. 3 (g-i) where measured lattice distances are indicated. The three HRTEM images in fig. 3 (g-i) present different crystals with different orientations, but they all match LZTNO. Specifically (g) lattice 1 = 3.3 Å, lattice 2 = 2.6 Å, angle = 74 degree. This for example match hkl (211), hkl (12-2), zone axis [-453], (h) lattice 1 = 5.7 Å, lattice 2 = 4.6 Å, angle = 90 degree. This for example match hkl (110), hkl (1-11), zone axis [1-1-2], (i) lattice 1 = 3.5 Å, lattice 2 = 3.3 Å, angle = 78 degree. This for example match hkl (211), hkl (11-2), zone axis [-351].

## 3.2. Electrochemical Studies

Fig. 4 (a & b) is showing initial charge and discharge capacities of LZTNO (x = 0, 0.05, 0.1) materials at 0.1C and 0.2C rates respectively at a potential between 0.05V - 3V. The charge / discharge capacities of LZTNO-0 and LZTNO-05 at 0.1C and 0.2C for first, second, 20<sup>th</sup> and 40<sup>th</sup> cycle is represented in fig. 4(c- f). It is obvious from the fig. 4(c & d) that the initial capacity for pristine and doped material during first cycle is higher as compared to theoretical capacity. This phenomenon can be explained on the basis of the fact that on the surface of electrode during first cycle electrolyte is decomposed as a result of irreversible electrochemical reaction, here trapping of some inactive Li<sup>+</sup> causes formation of solid electrolyte interface (SEI) which is very dense and even film. Anode materials commonly exhibit this phenomenon [17, 51-54]. For the initial charge and discharge curves two apparent plateaus at 1.42 V and 0.71 V are observed which gradually fade in successive cycles. These plateaus are corresponding to the lithium intercalation/ deintercalation [8, 55]. Quite obvious capacity retention is shown by the LZTNO-05 material at all C- rates as compared to pristine LZTNO-0. Decreases in charge / discharge capacity of LZTNO-0 is more rapid on subsequent cycling.



Fig. 4. Charge-discharge curves of LZTNO at (a,c & d) 0.1C and (b,e & f) 0.2C

In Fig. 5 the cycling performance and coulombic efficiencies of LZTNO (x=0, 0.05, 0.1) materials between 0.05 and 3V is shown at 1C, 2C and 5C. From this figure it is clear that the LZTNO-05 sample is showing higher lithium storage capacity as compared to other samples

after 50 cycles at all C rates. All the materials are showing close to 100% coulombic efficiency at all C rates. The difference between the discharge and charge plateau increases with increased C-rate (1C, 2C and 5C) for all materials. The LZTNO-05 material shows higher charge and discharge capacities compared to LZTO and LZTNO-1 material at all C- rates (0.1, 0.2C, 1C, 2C, and 5C), Table S2.



Fig. 5. Cycling properties and coulombic efficiencies of LZTNO (a) x = 0, (b) x = 0.05 and (c) x = 0.1 respectively.

The electrochemical reaction mechanism for LZTNO (x = 0, 0.05, 0.1) was studied with the help of cyclic voltammetry. Studies were carried out at a scan rate of 0.5 mVs<sup>-1</sup> and the potential range was 0.05- 3 Volts Fig. 6(a). The anodic peak potential ( $\phi_{Pa}$ ), cathodic peak potential ( $\phi_{Pc}$ ) and the difference between anodic and cathodic peaks ( $\Delta \phi_{P}$ ) are given in Table



**Fig. 6.** (a) Cyclic Voltammetry (CV) curves (b) Rate performance (c) Dependence of specific capacity on C-rate (d) Cycling performance of LZTNO materials at different rates.

All materials showed a pair of cathodic and anodic peaks in the range of 1-2 V which represents that a small amount of Nb-doping did not affect the mechanism of electrochemical oxidation reduction reaction of LZTO. The oxidation peak which appeared up to 1.7 V is regarded as the  $Ti^{+3}/Ti^{+4}$  oxidation reaction as in case of spinel Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> [56]. The difference in potential between cathodic and anodic peak represent the degree of polarization. The potential difference values of samples LZTNO (x = 0, 0.05, 0.1) between oxidation and reduction peaks are 499, 474 and 534 mV respectively (Table 1) showing that the potential difference between cathodic and anodic peak is smallest for LZTNO-05. This sample is showing higher diffusion of lithium ion and less polarization between electrodes as compared to pristine and other samples. As a result, reversibility and cyclic stability of the electrodes are improved by appropriate doping of LZTO. An enveloped broad peak at low voltage (below 0.05 V) is attributed to the amorphous phase that may be a quasi- rock-salt [44]. Fig. 6(b) shows the relationship between the amount of doping and the specific capacity at different C rates. It is obvious from this data that LZTNO-05 is showing highest capacity at all C rates. Fig. 6(c) shows the relation between specific capacity decreases and at all C rates the LZTNO-05 material showed highest capacity as compared to other materials. Fig. 6d shows the cycling performance of LZTNO at various C rates. These results confirmed that LZTNO-05 material have better rate properties and cycling performance.

**Table 1.** Electrochemical parameters (Potential difference between anodic and cathodic peaks

 from CV and Fitting data from EIS patterns)

Sample	$\phi_{Pa}(V)$	$\phi_{Pc}(V)$	$\Delta \phi_P(mV)$	Rs (Ω)	$R_{ct}(\Omega)$
LZTO	1.726	1.227	499	6.522	115.3
LZTNO-05	1.696	1.222	474	10.31	77.86
LZTNO-1	1.761	1.227	534	3.317	87.91

In order to investigate Li<sup>+</sup> ion diffusion from inside to electrode's surface, its migration through surface films and charge transfer interface electrochemical impedance spectroscopy was used [57].



Fig. 7. (a)EIS curves of LZTNO materials (b) Graph of  $Z_{re}$  plotted against  $\omega^{-1/2}$  at low frequency region

Nyquist plots of LZTNO samples are shown in fig. 7(a). The semicircle in the high frequency region indicates charge transfer resistance and in the low frequency region lithium ion diffusion is represented by an inclined line. An equivalent circuit was fitted through Elchemea analytical, shown in the inset. If we take into account the demonstration of Randles equivalent circuit it represents charge transfer resistance, double layer capacitance and electrolyte resistance. Data on the basis of fitting of equivalent circuit of charge transfer resistance ( $R_{ct}$ ) and Ohmic resistance ( $R_s$ ) of the solution is also listed in Table 1. In fig. 7(a), CPE represents a constant phase element which is used in electrical circuits to represent the behavior of double layer and W is the Warburg impedance [58], which is due to diffusion resistance.

The data indicates that the LZTNO-05 sample has less Ohmic and charge transfer resistance as compared to pristine LZTO and LZTNO-1 sample. An appropriate amount of Nb doping on Ti site resulted in decreasing Ohmic as well as charge transfer resistance between

active material and electrolyte. During cycling this material shows better electrochemical activity than un-doped. Li ion diffusion can be calculated from the straight line obtained in low frequency region of EIS data using following equations [2, 52, 59].

$$\mathbf{D}_{\mathrm{Li}}^{+} = \frac{1}{2} \left( \frac{RT}{n^{2F^{2}} A C_{Li} \sigma} \right)^{2} \tag{1}$$

Whereas R is the general gas constant (8.314Jmol<sup>-1</sup>K<sup>-1</sup>), T is the absolute temperature (298K), n is the number of electrons transferred in the half reaction of the redox couple, Faraday's constant is F (96485C mol<sup>-1</sup>), the area of the electrode is A (1.77cm<sup>2</sup>), the Li ion concentration in material is C<sub>Li</sub>. From the slope of line  $Z_{re}$ - $\omega$ <sup>-1/2</sup> we get the value of the Warburg factor  $\sigma$  Fig. 7(b).

The relationship between  $\omega$  i.e. Warburg impedance and Zre i.e. real part of impedance is given in eq. 2.

$$Z_{re} = R_{ct} + R_{s+}\sigma \,\omega^{-l/2} \tag{2}$$

With the help of equation 1 and 2 the calculated value of lithium ion diffusion coefficients LZTNO (x = 0, 0.05, 0.1) were  $1.1 \times 10^{-15}, 5.8 \times 10^{-15}$  and  $1.98 \times 10^{-15}$  cm<sup>2</sup>s<sup>-1</sup> respectively. From these values it can be inferred that diffusion of lithium ions in LZTNO-05 sample revealed a slight increase.

Preliminary *in situ* X-ray diffraction data on LZTNO-05 were collected using a discharge/charge current of 50 microA. A discharge capacity of 1.2 mAh was obtained (ca. 300 mAh/g) for the first discharge but only a short charge step was possible, ca. 80 m



**Fig. 8.** (a) Two-dimensional representation of a part of the diffraction patterns during the first discharge/charge cycle of LZTNO-05. The current during discharge was 50 micro A and the voltage is showed as inset at the right side. (b) Unit cell parameter (*a*-axis) during the first discharge/charge cycle of LZTNO-05. (c) XRD patterns of LZTNO-05 at different charge/discharge state in the initial, charged and final state. The arrows indicate contributing reflections from the copper grid in the *in-situ* cell.

Fig. 8(a) shows a high-angle section of the diffraction patterns as a function of time, together with the corresponding discharge/charge curve, three-dimension representation of the diffraction pattern is given in the Fig. 3S. Changes in the unit cell parameter are clearly visible during discharge. Using Rietveld refinement, the unit cell parameter was determined for each scan, Fig. 8(b) The unit cell parameters were determined from Rietveld refinement and the uncertainties given are from the refinement program (Full Prof) and the corresponding discharge/charge curve. An expansion of the unit cell is observed during the first part of the discharge. However, a maximum is observed approximately halfway through the discharge and a small contraction of the unit cell is observed in the last part of the discharge process. Significant changes in the intensities of the diffraction peaks are observed also in the last part of the discharge coupled with a broadening of the diffraction lines. This could signify larger structural changes upon intercalation of the lithium ions in the structure, either structural rearrangement or loss of some of the structural integrity of the material. As can be seen from Fig. 8(a), this process is reversible as the crystallinity and intensity distribution is recovered during charge. XRD patterns of LZTNO-05 at different charge/discharge state in the initial, charged and final state are represented in Fig. 8(c).

#### 4. Conclusions

Cubic spinel structured LZTNO were synthesized through ball milling assisted solid state route which is a facile method. Ti<sup>4+</sup> was partially substituted by Nb<sup>+5</sup> without destroying the crystal structure and mechanism of electrochemical reaction of LZTO. The electrochemical performance of the materials studied is dependent on the Nb-substitution degree with LZTNO-

05 (Li<sub>2</sub>ZnTi<sub>2.95</sub>Nb<sub>0.05</sub>O<sub>8</sub>) as the best performing material. LZTNO-05 delivered the highest discharge capacity at different C-rates, the lowest interface resistance, best rate capability and cycle stability of the prepared materials. The results show that the discharge capacity of pristine LZTO material are much smaller than for LZTNO-05. This enhancement in cycling stability and rate capacity can be attributed to reduced electrode polarization, lessened charge transfer resistance and enhancement of lithium ion diffusion coefficient. With a low cost and facile method LZTO and its Nb<sup>+5</sup> doped analogues are prepared which are promising electrode materials for lithium ion batteries.

Preliminary in situ XRD experiments revealed interesting reversible structural changes during discharge/charge. However, further in situ studies are needed in order to elucidate the structural changes during the discharge/charge processes.

#### Acknowledgments

The author is thankful to the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan for providing the IRSIP scholarship. This work was also supported by the DTU Energy project: Valuable carbon products from waste biomass (grant number 49734 E-1).

#### **Authors contribution**

This research was a part of PHD work of N. F. under supervision of N.A and P. N. All the experimental work was carried out at the Department of Chemistry, Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad Pakistan and Department of Energy Conversion and Storage, DTU by N.F. P.K. helped N.F in writing manuscript, S.B.S helped with TEM experiments and data analysis. N.A and P.N finally reviewed the whole manuscript.

## References

[1] H. Li, Z. Wang, L. Chen, X. Huang, Adv. mater., 21 (2009) 4593-4607.

[2] C.-K. Lan, S.-I. Chuang, Q. Bao, Y.-T. Liao, J.-G. Duh, J. Power Sources, 275 (2015)660-667.

- [3] K.-S. Park, A. Benayad, D.-J. Kang, S.-G. Doo, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 130 (2008) 14930-14931.
- [4] Y. Xu, Z. Hong, L. Xia, J. Yang, M. Wei, Electrochim. Acta, 88 (2013) 74-78.
- [5] Z. Hong, M. Wei, X. Ding, L. Jiang, K. Wei, Electrochem. Commun., 12 (2010) 720-723.
- [6] J. Liu, C. Du, Z. Tang, Ionics, 20 (2014) 1495-1500.
- [7] J. Wang, H. Zhao, Y. Shen, Z. Du, X. Chen, Q. Xia, ChemPlusChem, 78 (2013) 1530-1535.
- [8] Z. Hong, X. Zheng, X. Ding, L. Jiang, M. Wei, K. Wei, Energy Environ. Sci., 4 (2011) 1886-1891.
- [9] Z. Wen, X. Wang, S. Mao, Z. Bo, H. Kim, S. Cui, G. Lu, X. Feng, J. Chen, Adv. Mater., 24 (2012) 5610-5616.
- [10] H. Tang, L. Zan, W. Mao, Z. Tang, J. Electroanal. Chem., 751 (2015) 57-64.
- [11] E. Pohjalainen, J. Kallioinen, T. Kallio, J. Power Sources, 279 (2015) 481-486.
- [12] Y. Wang, A. Zhou, X. Dai, L. Feng, J. Li, J. Li, J. Power Sources, 266 (2014) 114-120.
- [13] H. Park, T. Song, H. Han, U. Paik, J. Power Sources, 244 (2013) 726-730.
- [14] X. Sun, P.V. Radovanovic, B. Cui, New J. Chem., 39 (2015) 38-63.
- [15] B. Chen, C. Du, Y. Zhang, R. Sun, L. Zhou, L. Wang, Electrochim. Acta, 159 (2015) 102-110.
- [16] Y. Ren, P. Lu, X. Huang, J. Ding, H. Wang, RSC Adv., 6 (2016) 49298-49306.
- [17] W. Chen, Z. Zhou, R. Wang, Z. Wu, H. Liang, L. Shao, J. Shu, Z. Wang, RSC Adv., 5(2015) 49890-49898.
- [18] X. Li, Q. Xiao, B. Liu, H. Lin, J. Zhao, J. Power Sources, 273 (2015) 128-135.
- [19] L. Wang, L. Wu, Z. Li, G. Lei, P. Zhang, Electrochim. Acta, 56 (2011) 5343-5346.

- [20] H. Yang, J. Park, C.-S. Kim, Y.-H. Xu, H.-L. Zhu, Y.-X. Qi, L.-W. Yin, H. Li, N. Lun,Y.-J. Bai, J. Power Sources, 379 (2018) 270-277.
- [21] H. Tang, Y. Zhou, L. Zan, N. Zhao, Z. Tang, Electrochim. Acta, 191 (2016) 887-894.
- [22] S. Wang, L. Wang, Z. Meng, B. Luo, RSC Adv., 8 (2018) 31628-31632.
- [23] C. Chen, C. Ai, X. Liu, Y. Wu, Electrochim. Acta, 227 (2017) 285-293.
- [24] T.-F. Yi, J.-Z. Wu, J. Yuan, Y.-R. Zhu, P.-F. Wang, ACS Sustain. Chem. Eng, 3 (2015) 3062-3069.
- [25] H. Li, Z. Li, X. Liang, J. Ouyang, Y. Ma, Y. Cui, C. Ma, Z. Tang, Mater. Lett., 192 (2017)128-132.
- [26] F. Qie, Z. Tang, Mater. Express, 4 (2014) 221-227.
- [27] S. Wang, Y. Bi, L. Wang, Z. Meng, B. Luo, Electrochim. Acta, 301 (2019) 319-324.
- [28] H. Tang, Z. Tang, C. Du, F. Qie, J. Zhu, Electrochim. Acta, 120 (2014) 187-192.
- [29] C. Chen, C. Ai, X. Liu, Electrochim. Acta, 265 (2018) 448-454.
- [30] B. Tian, H. Xiang, L. Zhang, Z. Li, H. Wang, Electrochim. Acta, 55 (2010) 5453-5458.
- [31] W. Chen, H. Liang, W. Ren, L. Shao, J. Shu, Z. Wang, J. Alloys Compd., 611 (2014) 65-73.
- [32] Y. Li, C. Du, J. Liu, F. Zhang, Q. Xu, D. Qu, X. Zhang, Z. Tang, Electrochim. Acta, 167(2015) 201-206.
- [33] H. Tang, J. Zhu, Z. Tang, C. Ma, J. Electroanal. Chem., 731 (2014) 60-66.
- [34] H. Tang, Z. Tang, J.Alloys Compd., 613 (2014) 267-274.
- [35] S.B. Simonsen, T.T. Muhl, K.T.S. Thydén, C. Chatzichristodoulou, J. Nielsen, B.R. Sudireddy, Solid State Ion., 340 (2019) 115019.
- [36] Z. Zhong, Electrochem. Solid-State Lett., 10 (2007) A267-A269.
- [37] T. Lan, H. Qiu, F. Xie, J. Yang, M. Wei, Sci. Rep., 5 (2015) 8498.

[38] T.-F. Yi, Z.-K. Fang, Y. Xie, Y.-R. Zhu, S.-Y. Yang, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces, 6 (2014) 20205-20213.

[39] H. Li, Z. Li, Y. Cui, C. Ma, Z. Tang, New J. Chem., 41 (2017) 975-981.

[40] S. Bhuvaneswari, U. Varadaraju, R. Gopalan, R. Prakash, Electrochim. Acta, 327 (2019)135008.

[41] H. Sun, Y. Chen, C. Xu, D. Zhu, L. Huang, J. Solid State Electrochem., 16 (2012) 1247-1254.

[42] S. Bhuvaneswari, U. Varadaraju, R. Gopalan, R. Prakash, Electrochim. Acta, 301 (2019)342-351.

- [43] A. Wei, W. Li, Q. Chang, X. Bai, R. He, L. Zhang, Z. Liu, Y. Wang, Electrochim. Acta, 323 (2019) 134692.
- [44] W. Chen, Z. Zhou, H. Liang, L. Shao, J. Shu, Z. Wang, J. Power Sources, 281 (2015) 56-68.
- [45] S.K. Singh, S.R. Kiran, V. Murthy, Mater. Chem. Phys., 141 (2013) 822-827.
- [46] C. Julien, M. Camacho-Lopez, Mater. Sci. Eng. B, 108 (2004) 179-186.
- [47] H. Song, S.-W. Yun, H.-H. Chun, M.-G. Kim, K.Y. Chung, H.S. Kim, B.-W. Cho, Y.-T. Kim, Energy Environ. Sci., 5 (2012) 9903-9913.
- [48] Y. Ge, H. Jiang, K. Fu, C. Zhang, J. Zhu, C. Chen, Y. Lu, Y. Qiu, X. Zhang, J. Power Sources, 272 (2014) 860-865.
- [49] T. Senda, R.C. Bradt, J. Am. Ceram. Soc., 74 (1991) 1296-1302.
- [50] J. Mao, K. Dai, M. Xuan, G. Shao, R. Qiao, W. Yang, V.S. Battaglia, G. Liu, ACS Appl.Mater. Interfaces, 8 (2016) 9116-9124.
- [51] L. Yang, X. Zhang, Y. Li, F. Hao, H. Chen, M. Yang, D. Fang, Electrochim. Acta, 155 (2015) 272-278.
- [52] W. Chen, H. Liang, L. Shao, J. Shu, Z. Wang, Electrochim. Acta, 152 (2015) 187-194.

- [53] X. Li, L. Qiao, D. Li, X. Wang, W. Xie, D. He, J. Mater. Chem. A, 1 (2013) 6400-6406.
- [54] J. Guo, F. Li, J. Sui, H. Zhu, X. Zhang, Ionics, 20 (2014) 1635-1639.
- [55] L. Wang, Q. Xiao, Z. Li, G. Lei, L. Wu, P. Zhang, J. Mao, Electrochim. acta, 77 (2012)77-82.
- [56] B. Wang, J. Wang, J. Cao, H. Ge, Y. Tang, J. Power Sources, 266 (2014) 150-154.
- [57] K. Shaju, G.S. Rao, B. Chowdari, J. Mater. Chem., 13 (2003) 106-113.
- [58] Y. Shi, L. Wen, F. Li, H.-M. Cheng, J. Power Sources, 196 (2011) 8610-8617.
- [59] B. Li, C. Han, Y.-B. He, C. Yang, H. Du, Q.-H. Yang, F. Kang, Energy Environ. Sci., 5 (2012) 9595-9602.