

Trends in High-Temperature H $_2$ Production on CeO $_2$ Co-Doped with Trivalent Cations in Solid Oxide Electrolysis Celfs

Wu, Tiantian; Vegge, Tejs; Anton Hansen, Heine

Published in: Journal of Catalysis

Link to article, DOI: 10.1016/j.jcat.2023.02.010

Publication date: 2023

Document Version Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Link back to DTU Orbit

Citation (APA): Wu, T., Vegge, T., & Anton Hansen, H. (2023). Trends in High-Temperature H_Production on CeO_Co-Doped with Trivalent Cations in Solid Oxide Electrolysis Cells. *Journal of Catalysis, 420,* 1-8. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcat.2023.02.010

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

• Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.

- · You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Journal of Catalysis 420 (2023) 1-8

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Journal of Catalysis

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/jcat

Trends in high-temperature H₂ production on CeO₂ Co-doped with trivalent cations in solid oxide electrolysis cells



JOURNAL OF CATALYSIS

Tiantian Wu^{a,b}, Tejs Vegge^{b,*}, Heine Anton Hansen^{b,*}

^a School of Chemistry, Engineering Research Center of Energy Storage Materials and Devices of Ministry of Education, National Innovation Platform (Center) for Industry-Education Integration of Energy Storage Technology, Xi'an Jiaotong University, Xi'an 710049, China
^b Department of Energy Conversion and Storage, Technical University of Denmark, Anker Engelunds Vej Building 301, 2800 Kgs. Lyngby, Denmark

ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 29 November 2022 Revised 27 January 2023 Accepted 17 February 2023 Available online 18 February 2023

Keywords: Correlations Hydridic H-species Oxygen diffusion barriers Effect of potential Relative position of dopants

ABSTRACT

CeO₂-based catalysts incorporated with cooperative dopants show excellent potential for promoting H_2 production via the water-splitting reaction (WSR) in solid oxide electrolysis cells (SOECs). Here, we report that CeO₂ co-doped with Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb trivalent cations have superior performance for WSR with the reaction rate 2–5 orders of magnitude larger than that of individual trivalent dopants including Ga, Sb, Lu, Gd, Sm, Pr, Bi, and La, owing to improved stability of hydridic H-species and accordingly decreased barrier for their decompositions into H₂ by co-doping. The energy of hydridic H-species and the turn-over frequency (TOF) toward H₂ production is shown to correlate well with the average ionic radius of trivalent cations, where the TOF increases with decreasing ionic radius and Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb with smaller ionic radius show better WSR activity than other dopants. Our studies suggest incorporating ceria with proper co-dopants with an average radius close to Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, or Bi + Sb pairs as an effective strategy for enhancing WSR performance on CeO₂ in SOECs.

© 2023 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Inc. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

1. Introduction

The storage of renewable energy in the form of H_2 fuel via the WSR in SOECs is a sustainable way for energy storage and conversion [1–5]. The deployment of SOECs has been limited because of mechanical instability of cathodes and correspondingly decreased reactivity, owing to degradation at narrow gas/electrode/electrolyte reaction boundaries at a high operating temperature around 1200 K [1,2,4]. It is critical to developing both mechanically stable and kinetically active catalysts in cathodes of SOECs. Ceriabased materials have excellent ionic and electronic conductivity because ceria exposes a large ceria-gas reaction interface and is accessible for gas, electrons, and ions, which allows the stable operation at intermediate temperature (below 1200 K) and thus has been applied as cathodes for the WSR in SOECs [1–3,6,7].

For WSR in an SOEC, oxygen ions diffuse from the cathode to the anode to form oxygen gas, corresponding to the diffusion of oxygen vacancies from the deep layer to the top surface of the cathode [2,3]. Therefore, WSR on CeO_2 creates one oxygen vacancy in the subsurface, followed by the oxygen vacancy diffusion to the surface. Then, water adsorbs near the oxygen vacancy and dissociates into hydroxyls or hydridic H-species at the cathode [6,8]. Investiga-

* Corresponding authors. *E-mail addresses:* teve@dtu.dk (T. Vegge), heih@dtu.dk (H. Anton Hansen). tions on water dissociation over ceria for H₂ production have demonstrated that the fundamental reaction step of WSR on CeO₂ is the formation of hydroxyls or hydridic H-species (if hydrogen coverage is bevond one monolayer), followed by hydroxyl decomposition into H₂ [3,6,8-12]. There have been direct experimental observations of the formation of hydroxyls (O-H) or hydridic H-species (Ce-H) on CeO₂ during the reactions associated with water and hydrogen [13–15]. Our previous studies have identified an efficient reaction pathway for the WSR via the formation of hydridic H-species (Ce-H or dopant-H) on CeO₂ [6,8,10,12], where the total free energy barrier for H₂ production at 800 K via the formation of Ce-H on clean $CeO_2(111)$ surface is 2.91 eV. At the same time, it decreases to 2.66 eV by Gd doping because of the more favorable formation of Gd-H than Ce-H. Therefore, a key for further improving WSR on CeO₂ is to stabilize the formation of hydridic Hspecies, especially to promote the formation of dopant-H on CeO₂ by incorporating CeO₂ with proper dopants.

To facilitate the formation of hydridic H-species and improve the reaction kinetics of WSR on CeO_2 at intermediate temperature, incorporating dopants in CeO_2 holds excellent potential due to their positive effect on electronic structure, oxygen vacancy formation, ionic conductivity, and intermediate-temperature stability of ceria that have widely reported in SOECs [16–21]. Till now, many detailed investigations have been conducted on how individual dopants such as Gd, Sm, La, and Pr engineer the reactivity of ceria

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcat.2023.02.010 0021-9517/© 2023 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Inc.

This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



[6,22–27]. In contrast, a few studies have explored co-doping strategies for promoting the H₂ production via WSR on ceria, and how co-dopants affect the formation of hydridic H-species (Ce-H or dopant-H) remains unclear. Our previous computational studies on the Pr and Bi (Pr + Bi) cooperative pair have given inspiration for using co-doping as an effective strategy for improving the WSR over CeO₂ because Bi and Pr co-dopants can effectively stabilize hydridic H-species and lower the barrier to produce H₂, leading to the significantly enhanced WSR activity compared to individual Pr, Bi or Gd dopant [28]. It has been reported that Pr + Bi co-doped ceria has lower activation energy than Gd-doped samples under wet 4% H₂ atmosphere, although good WSR performance was not always found because of the complicated impact of steam, hydrogen and oxygen pressure [29]. Therefore, incorporating co-dopants in CeO₂ could be a strategy for engineering WSR performance in SOECs.

Here, we perform computational studies on WSR on more candidate dopants, including Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, Bi + Sb, Gd + Bi, and La + Bi trivalent pairs in CeO₂, as well as individual trivalent dopants such as Ga-, Sb-, Lu-, Gd-, Sm-, Pr-, Bi- and La-doped CeO₂, based on density-functional theory (DFT) [30]. This work will give more understanding of how cooperative dopants in ceria adjust the formation of reaction intermediates (especially the effect on the relative stability between dopant-H and Ce-H) and how they affect reaction kinetics of the WSR. We also investigated the effect of co-doping on oxygen diffusion and the effect of the relative position of trivalent pairs on the WSR activity. Our DFT works will give suggestions on how to choose a proper co-doped pair in ceria with good stability and excellent WSR activity.

2. Simulation models and methods

DFT studies are performed mainly on the WSR into H₂ via the hydridic H-species on the doped $CeO_2(111)$ surface as illustrated in Fig. 1. As we have done in our previous studies on Gd doped CeO₂(111) [6], the computational model of individually doped and co-doped CeO₂(111) is built as a 2×3 surface unit cell consisting of three O-Ce-O atomic layers, with the O-Ce-O layer at the bottom fixed during all DFT studies. A vacuum gap with a thickness of 15 Å is applied in the unit cell to block the interaction between periodic cells. For creating doped CeO₂, two cerium atoms are substituted with two dopants (M1 and M2), as shown in Fig. 1, corresponding to doping concentration of 11%. When M1 = M2, we created individually doped CeO₂, including Ga-, Sb-, Lu-, Gd-, Sm-, Pr-, Bi-, and La-doped CeO₂. When M1 is different from M2, cooperative dopants in CeO₂ are created, such as Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, Bi + Sb, Gd + Bi, and La + Bi co-doped CeO₂. As noted in Fig. 1, the studied M1 and M2 sit as nearest neighbors in the top layer of $CeO_2(111)$, owing to the relatively higher stability compared to other relative positions (Figure S1) of M1 and M2, as shown in Tables S1 and S2 in the supporting information. Our previous studies also found the favorable formation of trivalent dopants sitting as neighbors in the top layer of the ceria [28]. In addition to the good stability of trivalent pairs as neighbors in the top layer of the ceria surface, they also show excellent WSR performance. A more detailed discussion on the effect of the relative position of dopants on WSR is included in the section 'Results and discussions'.

To learn the structural properties of individually doped and codoped ceria and their WSR performance, we conduct spinpolarized DFT calculations with the Perdew-Burke-Ernzerhof (PBE) [31] functional by using the Vienna ab initio simulation package (VASP, version 5.4.4) [32], where a Hubbard U term (U_{eff} = 4.5 eV [33–36]) is applied to the PBE functional to describe electron localization on the 4f shells of Ce, and Pr. No U corrections are applied to 4f shells of Gd, Sm, La, or Lu because we did not find any partial electron delocalization on them without a U correction. In addition, our previous studies have identified that the relative stability between dopant-H and Ce-H is not affected by the exact U_{eff} value [28]. U_{eff} = 4.5 eV is reasonable for investigating electrocatalysis on clean and doped CeO₂ [6,28]. The wave functions are expanded in plane waves with an energy cutoff of 550 eV [6,10] and a Γ centered $3 \times 2 \times 1$ k-point mesh is used for sampling the Brillouin zone. The La(5d¹6s²), Bi(4f¹⁴5d¹⁰6s²6p³), Lu(4f¹⁴5d¹⁶s²), Sb $(4d^{10}5s^25p^3)$, Ga $(3d^{10}4s^24p^1)$, Gd $(4f^75d^16s^2)$, Sm $(4f^66s^2)$, Pr $(4f^{3}6s^{2})$, and Ce $(4f^{1}5d^{1}6s^{2})$ electrons were treated as valence states. The doped ceria surface is fully relaxed until reaching a force tolerance of 0.03 eV/Å. For La, Bi, Lu, Sb, and Ga, their spins have no initial setting because the magnetization is always zero when the valence equals + 3. For Gd, Sm and Ce, the initial setting of their spins did not affect identifying the final stable magnetization, as shown in Tables S3-S5, where the energy difference among different spin settings is smaller than 0.032 eV. However, among the studied cations, we found the final magnetization of Pr in Pr + Sb co-doped ceria is sensitive to the initial setting, as shown in **Table S6**, where the best initial guess of the spin of Pr^{3+} is 2, agreeing well with the previous studies [28]. The activation barriers of hydroxyl decomposition into H₂ in the individually doped and co-doped ceria are identified by the climbing image nudgedelastic band method [37] as implemented in VASP.

3. Results and discussions

As demonstrated in our previous studies, H₂ production on partially hydroxylated ceria needs to overcome a high barrier of 3.0– 3.5 eV [6,12]. Instead, it is usually more favorable to form more hydroxyls on ceria by creating more oxygen vacancies and further via water dissociation, finally leading to the WSR proceeding readily on an overly hydroxylated ceria surface through a barrier below 3.0 eV (2.2 eV for Gd doped ceria [6], and 1.7 eV for Pr + Bi codoped ceria [28]). On the studied ceria surface, 6H bind with lattice oxygen to form the fully hydroxylated ceria. There are two stable configurations for the formation of an overly hydroxylated surface (7H). One possibility is that the seventh H binds with one lattice oxygen in the subsurface. The other possibility is that the seventh H binds with trivalent metal to form hydridic H (dopant-H or Ce-H), as shown in **Figure S2**. Herein, WSR pathways via the formation



Fig. 1. The illustrated WSR into H₂ on the doped CeO₂(111) surface, where H₂O easily dissociates into Ce-H, M1-H, M2-H hydridic H moieties on the doped surface. V₀ is an oxygen vacancy, while M1 and M2 are two trivalent dopants. The atoms in the deep layers are displayed as lines.

of 6H, dopant-H (M1-H or M2-H), and Ce-H are systematically investigated on differently doped ceria. The corresponding reaction steps are illustrated in Figure S2, where the net reaction is $H_2O \rightarrow H_2 + 1/2O_2$, and reactions along different reaction pathways are described below Figure S2. The identified stable dopant-H and Ce-H configurations are presented in Figures S3-S5. The top and side views of M-H (Ce-H or dopant-H) in Gd + Sb co-doped ceria labeled with M-H bond lengths are presented in Figure S5. M-H bond lengths of other doped ceria are listed in Table S7, where the bond length of Ce-H in doped ceria is around 2.3 Å and the bond length of Sb-H in Gd + Sb, Bi + Sb, and Pr + Sb codoped ceria is as low as 1.7 Å, indicating the stable formation of hydridic H-species in co-doped ceria. For the reaction on the clean ceria, 2Ce³⁺ are oxidized to 2Ce⁴⁺ due to the formation of Ce-H $(Ce^{4+}H^{-})$ on clean ceria via the reaction $7H^{+}+7Ce^{3+}\rightarrow 6H^{+}+5Ce^{3+}+-$ Ce⁴⁺+Ce⁴⁺H⁻, where the formal oxidation states are induced from the atomic spin states. The oxidation of 2Ce³⁺ to 2Ce⁴⁺ is also found in the doped ceria because of the formation of dopant-H (M1-H or M2-H) via the reaction of $7H^{+}+5Ce^{3+}+M1^{3+}+M2^{3+}\rightarrow 6H^{+}+3Ce^{3+}+2-$ Ce⁴⁺+M1³⁺+M2³⁺H⁻, with the exception of the formation of Sb-H on Sb, Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb doped ceria, where $Sb^{5+}H^{-}$ forms via the reaction of $7H^{+}+5Ce^{3+}+Sb^{3+}+M^{3+}\rightarrow 6H^{+}+5Ce^{3+}+M^{3+}+Sb^{5+}H^{-}$ (M = Sb, Gd, Pr, or Bi). Thus, for the formation of hydridic Hspecies including dopant-H and Ce-H, it is Ce⁴⁺H⁻ for Ce-H, Sb⁵⁺H⁻ for Sb-H, while for other trivalent dopants it is M³⁺H⁻.

Fig. 2 and S6-S15 show the free energy diagrams of WSR on individually doped or co-doped CeO₂(111) via the formation of 6H, dopant-H, and Ce-H at 800 K (an intermediate operation temperature of SOECs [2]). The free energy diagrams of the WSR on Gd-, Pr-, and Bi-doped ceria have been shown in our previous works [6,28], and thus are not presented in the supporting information. The free energy of reaction intermediates is calculated relative to the clean ceria surface by assuming the ceria-gas interface equilibrium with water steam and H₂ at 1 bar pressure and 800 K, referring to our previous DFT studies for more calculation details [6,10]. For producing one H₂ molecule, the breaking of the first O-H bond is difficult, and the highest transition states (TS) are associated with this bond breaking, as shown in Fig. 2 and S6-S15. Fig. 2 is a simplified reaction diagram and shows reactions via 5H + V₀, 6H, Ce-H and Sb-H. A full reaction pathway of WSR on Gd-Sb co-doped ceria is shown in Figure S6, where the barrier for producing one H_2 is 3.9, 3.5, 3.2, and 3.3 via 2H, 4H, 5H + V_0 , and 6H, respectively. However, H₂ is produced easily via the formation of an hydridic-H intermediate, through a 1.7 eV barrier via the Ce-H. For the H₂ production via 7H \rightarrow Sb-H \rightarrow H₂, a 1.5 eV barrier is firstly required for the formation of Sb-H. Then the decomposition of Sb-H involves the reaction between Sb-H and one O-H nearest to Sb, as presented in Fig. 2, leading to a 1.1 eV barrier for releasing one H₂ molecule. Both reaction barriers occurring before and after Sb-H are lower compared to the WSR via other paths, making the most efficient reaction pathway proceeding via the Sb-H on Gd + Sb co-doped ceria. In addition, a full reaction path in Figure S6 shows lower free energy of high H coverage like 5H, 6H, and 7H compared to the formation of 2H, indicating the facile formation of high H coverage at 800 K. It is found that for the WSR on Lu-, Sm-individually doped CeO₂(111), the most efficient reaction pathway is that the WSR proceeds via the formation of Ce-H, where the free energy of Ce-H is lower than dopant-H, as shown in Figures S7-S10. When it forms Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, Bi + Sb pairs in $CeO_2(111)$, the favorable reaction pathway shifts to that via the formation of dopant-H, where dopant-H becomes 1.0 eV more stable than Ce-H in Gd + Sb, as shown in Figure 2, and 1.3 eV more stable than Ce-H in Bi + Sb or Pr + Sb co-doped ceria, as noted in Figures S14 and S15. Our DFT calculations found that the improved stability of dopant-H by co-doping leads to more facile H₂ production via the formation of dopant-H than that via Ce-H.

To evaluate oxygen diffusion in doped ceria, the nearestneighbor oxygen vacancy to dopants is investigated as illustrated in Figure S16 because creating one oxygen vacancy near the dopants is reported more stable than other positions [6,28]. Table S8 shows the formation energy of one oxygen vacancy in the subsurface and that in the top surface of doped $CeO_2(111)$, and its diffusion barrier from the subsurface to the top surface (diffusion paths are presented in Figure S17), where the data of Gddoped ceria and pure ceria is taken from our previous work [6]. The formation energy of one oxygen vacancy in the studied doped CeO₂(111) is within 1.50 eV. However, it increases to 2.18 eV in the pure $CeO_2(111)$, as shown in **Table S8**, suggesting a much more favorable formation of oxygen vacancy in doped ceria than pure ceria. The identified diffusion barriers of one oxygen vacancy in individually doped ceria are comparable to the previously reported data [38-40]. As noted in **Table S8**, a smaller diffusion barrier (ranging from 0.09 to 0.66 eV) is found in co-doped ceria compared to the individually doped ceria (ranging from 0.17 to 0.80 eV). When the surface is covered by 5H, the diffusion barrier in Gd + Sb co-doped ceria remains lower than that in Gd-doped ceria, as shown in Figure S18. Therefore, our studies suggest an improved oxygen diffusion in ceria-based SOECs by co-doping.

Then, the WSR performance of differently doped ceria is evaluated by comparing the turn-over frequency (TOF) toward H₂ production, which is calculated using the energetic span (δE) [41,42] between TOF determining intermediate and TOF determining transition state. In Fig. 2, the TS for producing one H₂ via Sb-H is the TOF determining transition state (TDTS), and 5H + V₀^{sur} with the lowest free energy is the TOF determining intermediate (TDI). TOF is calculated by the equation.

$$TOF = \frac{k_B T}{h} \exp\left(\frac{-\delta E}{k_B T}\right)$$

It has been found that the TDTS is always associated with producing one H_2 via hydridic H-species (Ce-H or dopant-H), as noted in Fig. 2 and S7-S15, where 6H or 5H + V_o before the formation of hydridic H-species is identified as the TDI. It indicates that TDI and TDTS occur before and after the hydridic H-species, respectively, making hydridic H-species the key intermediates during WSR on doped ceria.

In addition to the WSR performance, the stability of incorporating ceria with dopants is evaluated by the doping energy (E_f) , which is the energy required to substitute one cerium oxide (CeO_2) with trivalent metal oxide $(M1_2O_3 \text{ or } M2_2O_3)$ and is defined as.

 $2E_{f} = E[M1M2Ce_{x-2}O_{2x-1}] - E[Ce_{x}O_{2x}] - 0.5 \times E[M1_{2}O_{3}] \\ -0.5 \times E[M2_{2}O_{3}] + 2 \times E[CeO_{2}].$

Fig. 3 (a) presents the calculated doping energy, and the calculated TOF toward H₂ production on differently doped ceria at 800 K is shown in Fig. 3 (b). The studied TOF in Fig. 3 is in the form of Log (TOF), suggesting a linear relationship between Log (TOF) and the according to the energetic span (δE) formula of $TOF = \frac{k_BT}{h} \exp\left(\frac{-\delta E}{k_BT}\right)$. TOF is found to correlate well with the average radius of the studied trivalent cations, where TOF decreases with an increasing average radius of trivalent cations and Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb. and Bi + Sb trivalent pairs show superior performance with TOF 2-4 orders of magnitude larger than individually doped ceria such as Ga-, Sb-, Lu-, Gd-, Sm-, Pr-, Bi- and La-doped CeO2. It is noted from Fig. 3 (b) that the trivalent dopants with small radius like Ga³⁺, Sb³⁺, and Lu³⁺ are not included in the correlation because of larger doping energy than other dopants, as shown in Fig. 3 (a). Larger doping energy in Ga-, Sb- and Lu-doped ceria suggests instability of ceria incorporated with individual Ga, Sb, or Lu. Therefore,



Fig. 2. Reaction pathways of the WSR on Gd + Sb co-doped CeO₂(111) via the formation of 6H, 5H + V₀, Sb-H, and Ce-H at 800 K, where Sb-H is 1.0 eV more stable than Ce-H. Transition states (TS) are presented at the bottom.

Ga-, Sb-, and Lu-doped ceria are not included in the following discussions. The TOF of the WSR on individual dopants like Pr, and Bi that have an ionic radius close to Ce, is comparable to clean ceria. However, the WSR activity is enhanced significantly through the cooperative Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb co-doping, suggesting a synergistic effect of co-doping in CeO₂ for promoting WSR. In addition to the excellent WSR performance on co-doped ceria, Fig. 3 (a) shows good stability of co-dopants in ceria due to low doping energy. Therefore, our DFT studies suggest that incorporating ceria with co-dopants, like Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb, is an effective strategy for promoting WSR on ceria-based cathodes in SOECs.

We have investigated the effect of potential on the free energy at each step of WSR on Gd + Sb co-doped ceria, as shown in **Figure S19** and found the TS for producing one H₂ via Sb-H remains the TDTS under the potential of -0.2 V. At the same time, 5H + V₀ with the lowest free energy remains the TDI. The free energy change for the formation of the TDI from the 5H surface at -0.2 V is 0.4 eV lower compared to that at zero potential because introducing the oxygen vacancy becomes more facile at more reducing potentials. This leaves the energetic span for the WSR unaffected by the applied potential, whereas the energetic span for the reverse hydrogen oxidation reaction increases by 0.4 eV. For the WSR on doped ceria at -0.2 V, the TDTS is always associated with producing one H₂ via hydridic H-species (Ce-H or dopant-H), while 6H or 5H + V₀ before the formation of hydridic H-species is identified as the TDI, as noted in **Figures S7-S15 and S19**, in line with the findings at zero potential. **Figure S20** shows a correlation between TOF and ionic radius at -0.2 V, where Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb with smaller ionic radius hold higher WSR activity than other dopants, in line with the findings at zero potential, as shown in Fig. 3. Therefore, the improvement in WSR activity by co-doping is not affected by applying a potential of -0.2 V.

We also investigated the effect of the relative position of trivalent co-dopants on the WSR activity. For the individually doped and co-doped CeO₂, two dopants sitting as nearest neighbors in the top layer is found to be more stable than other relative position, as noted in **Tables S1 and S2**, except Gd-, Sb-, Gd + Sb doped ceria. The energy of two dopant neighbors, with one located in the subsurface, is comparable to that two dopants sit on the top surface in Gd-doped ceria. At the same time, it becomes 0.454 eV more stable when two dopants sit on the top surface in Sb-doped ceria, as shown in **Table S2**. In Gd-doped ceria, WSR on the surface that 2Gd are neighbors with one Gd located in the subsurface is investigated because of the more favorable formation of hydroxyls than other relative positions of 2Gd, which has been detailedly discussed in our previous work [6]. In Sb-doped ceria, the WSR on the surface with 2Sb neighbors and one located in the subsurface



Fig. 3. (a) Comparison of the doping energy of individually doped and co-doped CeO₂. (b) The correlation between the turn-over frequency (TOF) of producing H₂ at 800 K and the average radius of the studied trivalent dopants.

is not further addressed because the doping energy is 1.28 eV higher than that 2Sb sitting on the top surface.

However, for Gd + Sb pairs, we found similar energy (within 0.02 eV) when Gd and Sb are nearest neighbors with Gd in the sublayer and when they are next-nearest neighbors with Gd in the sublayer. Then, more DFT calculations are conducted to investigate the effect of the relative position of Gd + Sb pairs on the WSR. The calculated reaction pathways are shown in **Figure S21**, where the formation of the surface that Sb sitting in the sublayer is found to be 0.8–1.1 eV unstable, and the formation of dopant-H is unfavorable compared to other relative positions, agreeing well with our previous findings that more favorable formation of reaction intermediates on a stable surface [28]. Although the free energy of Sb-H is comparable on the surfaces that Sb sits on the top surface, we found much more stable 6H, 7H, and 5H + H_2 on the Gd + Sb pair when Gd and Sb are exposed as nearest neighbors in the top surface and also much lower reaction barrier for H_2 production compared to the other relative positions (1.1 eV barrier for the Gd + Sb pair sitting as neighbors in the top layer, while 1.6 eV barrier for the pair that is not neighbored, as shown in **Figure S21**). Therefore, our DFT studies show that trivalent pairs sitting as neighbors in the studied ceria surface have better WSR performance than other relative positions.

The above superior WSR performance on Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb trivalent pairs compared to other doped ceria is attributed to the much more favorable formation of dopant-H over Ce-H as

presented in Fig. 4 (a) and Table S9, where the formation energy of dopant-H is 2.5-3.0 times lower than Ce-H on Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb co-doped ceria. At the same time, it is comparable to Ce-H on other doped ceria. Lower energy in Fig. 4 suggests a more stable formation in DFT studies. In Fig. 4, Ga-, Sb-, and Lu-doped ceria are marked in grey and are not included in the discussion because of low stability, as found in Fig. 3 (a). The more favorable formation of Sb-H over Ce-H in Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb co-doped ceria introduces two more electrons that localize on the 4f orbitals of Ce, finally leading to the formation of 5Ce³⁺ for Sb-H binding, while only 3Ce³⁺ form for Ce-H binding, as noted in Figures S4 and S5. Therefore, the strong Sb-H binding in doped ceria shows donor-type conducting behavior, corresponding to the shift of E_f close to the conductive band for Sb-H binding compared to Ce-H binding, as shown in Figures S22-S24. The donor-type conducting behavior for Sb doped ceria has also been observed experimentally [27]. However, we did not identify a significant difference between the shift of E_f in other doped ceria (Figure S25-S35).

In addition, we find a linear correlation between the ionic radius of the studied dopants and the formation energy of the most stable hydridic H moiety on each doped-ceria surface, as shown in Fig. 4 (b), suggesting that incorporating ceria with small trivalent pairs that have an average radius close to Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb or Bi + Sb can significantly improve the formation of the dopant-H. The more favorable formation of dopant-H over Ce-H leads to facile H₂ pro-

duction via dopant-H, further enhancing the WSR performance on ceria, as shown in **Figures 3, S14 and S15**. At the same time, La + Bi and Gd + Bi co-dopants in ceria do not improve the WSR activity as significantly as Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb or Bi + Sb co-dopants, which is explained by the comparable formation energy of the hydridic H moiety on La-, Bi-, Gd- individually doped and codoped ceria as noted in Fig. 4 (b).

The ionic radius of dopants has often been used to evaluate lattice parameters of the doped CeO₂ [43], the stability of creating oxygen vacancies [44], reduction energy [45], binding energies of oxygen vacancies and dopants [46], kinetic barriers of oxygen diffusion in doped CeO_2 [44,47] and catalysis on doped ceria [48]. We have found a correlation between the energetic span (δE) and ionic radius and a correlation between the energetic span (δE) and E (Metal-H), as shown in Figure S36, which means the calculated energetic span (δE) for WSR via hydridic H-species (Ce-H or dopant-H) is dependent on the energy of hydridic H-species. Log (TOF) is also well described by the oxygen diffusion barrier, as shown in Figure S37, where oxygen diffusion barriers correlate with the radius of dopants, as shown in Figure S38. A decreased barrier in ceria incorporated with small dopants is understood because the small dopants enable more space for oxygen diffusion, indicating faster ionic conductivity in SOECs and facile formation of more oxygen vacancies in ceria surfaces (high reducibility of ceria) that further enables the formation of hydridic H-species via water dissociation.



Fig. 4. (a) The formation energy of the Ce-H and dopant-H on doped ceria surfaces. (b) The linear correlation between the average dopant radius and the formation energy of the most stable hydridic H intermediate, E(Metal-H).

In addition to the improved relative stability of dopant-H over Ce-H by Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb or Bi + Sb co-doping, surface local strain induced by co-doping could also contribute to the enhanced WSR activity on Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb or Bi + Sb co-doped ceria. Our previous work has shown that applying tensile strain can stabilize the formation of hydridic H-species on pure CeO₂(111) [10]. Therefore, incorporating ceria with small co-dopants such as Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb or Bi + Sb with 13% radius mismatch to pure ceria can achieve a large tensile strain, which could facilitate the formation of hydridic H-species, in line with a small E(Metal-H) for Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb co-doped ceria, as noted in Fig. 4(a).

SOECs usually operate at a temperature around 1200 K [1,2,4]. We further compare the WSR activity at operating temperatures ranging from 400 to 1200 K, as presented in Fig. 5. The corresponding energetic span for H₂ production at different temperature is listed in Table S10. For individually doped ceria, Gd- and Smdoped ceria holds better WSR performance than Pr-, Bi-, and Ladoped ceria, as noted in Fig. 5. Adding Gd or La into Bi-doped ceria that leads to the formation of Gd + Bi, La + Bi co-doped pairs can improve the TOF toward H₂ production as high as that on Gdand Sm-doped ceria. The reported operation temperature on Gddoped ceria can be extended to 773–1073 K [49,50]. To reach the same TOF on Gd-doped ceria at 773-1073 K, the operating temperature can be extended to 600-1000 K (as shown in Fig. 5) by incorporating ceria with the Gd + Sb pair and extended to 700-1000 K in Pr + Sb, Bi + Sb co-doped ceria, indicating that Gd + Sb, Bi + Sb, and Pr + Sb co-doping in ceria allows WSR at an intermediate temperature below 1000 K. TOF of the WSR on Gd + Sb is 10 times higher than Gd-doped ceria at 1000 K, 10² times higher than Gd-doped ceria at 800 K, and is up to 10⁵ times higher than Gd-doped ceria at 600 K, showing excellent WSR performance on co-doped ceria at an intermediate temperature below 1000 K.

4. Conclusions

By performing DFT studies of H_2 production via the WSR on individually Ga-, Sb-, Lu-, Gd-, Sm-, Pr-, Bi- and La-doped CeO₂, as well as Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, Bi + Sb, Gd + Bi, and La + Bi co-doped CeO₂, we find the stability of the key intermediates, hydridic Hspecies (dopant-H or Ce-H), is substantially improved by incorporating ceria with Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb pairs, where dopant-H becomes much more stable than Ce-H, leading to WSR proceeding more readily via dopant-H than Ce-H. The energy of hydridic H-species and the turn-over frequency toward H₂ production are found to correlate well with the average radius of paired trivalent cations. A correlation between TOF and ionic radius at -0.2 V is also found. In addition, the effect of the relative position of dopants on WSR was investigated, showing that trivalent pairs sitting as neighbors in the studied ceria surface have better WSR performance than the pairs far away from each other. DFT calculations also observe an improved oxygen diffusion in ceria-based SOECs by co-doping. TOF is also well described by the oxygen diffusion barrier. We further found that Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, and Bi + Sb co-doped ceria allow WSR at an intermediate temperature below 1000 K and hold superior WSR performance with TOF 2–5 orders of magnitude larger than individual trivalent dopants. Therefore, our DFT studies propose cooperative trivalent pairs as an effective strategy for improving the WSR on CeO₂ in SOECs and suggest proper candidates such as Gd + Sb, Pr + Sb, Bi + Sb, or the pairs with an average radius close to these.

Data availability

Data will be made available on request.

Declaration of Competing Interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Acknowledgments

This work was financially supported by the Velux Foundations through the research center V-Sustain (grant number 9455), natural science program on basic research project of Shaanxi province (2023-JC-QN-0155), and the Qinchuangyuan project of Shaanxi province (QCYRCXM-2022-31). The partial simulations on the effect of the relative position of dopants on WSR performance were conducted on supercomputing facilities provided by Hefei Advanced.

Appendix A. Supplementary material

Supporting data includes figures of free energy diagrams, atomic configurations, and density of states, and supporting tables of energy of dopants with different relative positions, the formation energy of Ce-H and dopant-H on doped ceria, energetic span for H₂ production on stoichiometric and doped $CeO_2(111)$, the oxygen formation energy and diffusion barrier, and other correlations. The supporting information is available free of charge and can be found online at Journal of Catalysis. Supplementary data



Fig. 5. The TOF of producing H₂ over the (a) co-doped and (b) individually doped ceria is a function of reaction temperature.

to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcat. 2023.02.010.

References

- [1] F.M. Sapountzi, J.M. Gracia, C.J. Weststrate, H.O.A. Fredriksson, J.W. Niemantsverdriet, Electrocatalysts for the generation of hydrogen, oxygen and synthesis gas, Prog. Energy Combust. Sci. 58 (2017) 1–35.
- [2] J.T.S. Irvine, D. Neagu, M.C. Verbraeken, C. Chatzichristodoulou, C. Graves, M.B. Mogensen, Evolution of the electrochemical interface in high-temperature fuel cells and electrolysers, Nat. Energy. 1 (2016) 15014.
- [3] Z.A. Feng, F. El Gabaly, X. Ye, Z.-X. Shen, W.C. Chueh, Fast vacancy-mediated oxygen ion incorporation across the ceria-gas electrochemical interface, Nat. Commun. 5 (2014) 4374.
- [4] A. Brisse, J. Schefold, M. Zahid, High temperature water electrolysis in solid oxide cells, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 33 (2008) 5375–5382.
- [5] J. Chi, H. Yu, Water electrolysis based on renewable energy for hydrogen production, Chinese, J. Catal. 39 (2018) 390–394.
- [6] T. Wu, Q. Deng, H.A. Hansen, T. Vegge, Mechanism of water splitting on gadolinium-doped C_eO2(111): A DFT+U study, J. Phys. Chem. C. 123 (2019) 5507–5517.
- [7] X. Tong, S. Ovtar, K. Brodersen, P.V. Hendriksen, M. Chen, A 4×4 cm² nanoengineered solid oxide electrolysis cell for efficient and durable hydrogen production, ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces. 11 (2019) 25996–26004.
- [8] H.A. Hansen, C. Wolverton, Kinetics and thermodynamics of H₂O dissociation on reduced CeO₂(111), J. Phys. Chem. C. 118 (2014) 27402–27414.
- [9] M. Molinari, S.C. Parker, D.C. Sayle, M.S. Islam, Water adsorption and its effect on the stability of low index stoichiometric and reduced surfaces of ceria, J. Phys. Chem. C. 116 (2012) 7073–7082.
- [10] T. Wu, T. Vegge, H.A. Hansen, Improved electrocatalytic water splitting reaction on CeO₂(111) by strain engineering: A DFT+U study, ACS Catal. 9 (2019) 4853–4861.
- [11] Z. Yang, Q. Wang, S. Wei, D. Ma, Q. Sun, The effect of environment on the reaction of water on the ceria (111) surface: A DFT+U study, J. Phys. Chem. C. 114 (2010) 14891–14899.
- [12] T. Wu, N. López, T. Vegge, H.A. Hansen, Facet-dependent electrocatalytic water splitting reaction on CeO₂: A DFT+U Study, J. Catal. 388 (2020) 1–10.
 [13] L. Gill, A. Beste, B. Chen, M. Li, A.K.P. Mann, S.H. Overbury, E.W. Hagaman, Fast
- [13] L. Gill, A. Beste, B. Chen, M. Li, A.K.P. Mann, S.H. Overbury, E.W. Hagaman, Fast MAS ¹HNMR study of water adsorption and dissociation on the (100) surface of ceria nanocubes: A fully hydroxylated, hydrophobic ceria surface, J. Phys. Chem. C. 121 (2017) 7450–7465.
- [14] F. Dvořák, L. Szabová, V. Johánek, M. Farnesi Camellone, V. Stetsovych, M. Vorokhta, A. Tovt, T. Skála, I. Matolínová, Y. Tateyama, J. Mysliveček, S. Fabris, V. Matolín, Bulk hydroxylation and effective water splitting by highly reduced cerium oxide: The role of O vacancy coordination, ACS Catal. 8 (2018) 4354–4363.
- [15] Z. Wu, Y. Cheng, F. Tao, L. Daemen, G.S. Foo, L. Nguyen, X. Zhang, A. Beste, A.J. Ramirez-Cuesta, Direct neutron spectroscopy observation of cerium hydride species on a cerium oxide catalyst, J. Am. Chem. Soc. 139 (2017) 9721–9727.
- [16] Y. Park, S.K. Kim, D. Pradhan, Y. Sohn, Surface treatment effects on CO oxidation reactions over Co, Cu, and Ni-doped and codoped CeO₂ catalysts, Chem. Eng. J. 250 (2014) 25–34.
- [17] Z. Pu, X. Liu, A. Jia, Y. Xie, J. Lu, M. Luo, Enhanced activity for CO oxidation over Pr- and Cu-doped CeO₂ Catalysts: Effect of oxygen vacancies, J. Phys. Chem. C. 112 (2008) 15045–15051.
- [18] S. Banerjee, P.S. Devi, D. Topwal, S. Mandal, Enhanced ionic conductivity in Ce_{0.8}Sm_{0.2}O_{1.9}: Unique effect of calcium co-doping, Adv. Funct. Mater. 17 (2007) 2847–2854.
- [19] Y. Dong, S. Hampshire, B. Lin, Y. Ling, X. Zhang, High sintering activity Cu–Gd co-doped CeO₂ electrolyte for solid oxide fuel cells, J. Power Sources. 195 (2010) 6510–6515.
- [20] G. Zhou, W. Xiao, W. Geng, J. Wang, B. Xue, L. Wang, Improvement of the homogeneity and oxygen storage capability of $Ce_{1-x} Zr_x O_{2-\delta}$ by co-doping: A first-principles study, J. Alloys Compd. 817 (2020).
- [21] K. Sandhya, N.S. Chitra Priya, D.N. Rajendran, P. Thappily, Structural and electrical properties of cerium oxides doped by Sb³⁺ and Bi³⁺ cations, J. Electron. Mater. 49 (2020) 4936–4944.
- [22] R. Farra, M. García-Melchor, M. Eichelbaum, M. Hashagen, W. Frandsen, J. Allan, F. Girgsdies, L. Szentmiklósi, N. López, D. Teschner, Promoted ceria: A structural, catalytic, and computational study, ACS Catal. 3 (2013) 2256–2268.
- [23] H. Inaba, R. Sagawa, H. Hayashi, K. Kawamura, Molecular dynamics simulation of gadolinia-doped ceria, Solid State Ionics. 122 (1999) 95–103.

- [24] X. Aparicio-Anglès, A. Roldan, N.H. De Leeuw, Gadolinium-vacancy clusters in the (111) surface of gadolinium-doped ceria: A density functional theory study, Chem. Mater. 27 (2015) 7910–7917.
- [25] D.E.P. Vanpoucke, P. Bultinck, S. Cottenier, V. Van Speybroeck, I. Van Driessche, Aliovalent doping of CeO₂: DFT study of oxidation state and vacancy effects, J. Mater. Chem. A. 2 (2014) 13723–13737.
- [26] T. Kolodiazhnyi, T. Charoonsuk, M. Spreitzer, N. Vittayakorn, Analysis of Sbdoped ceria: Magnetism, conductivity, dielectric, specific heat and optical properties, J. Eur. Ceram. Soc. 39 (2019) 418–423.
- [27] K. Neuhaus, B. Gerke, O. Niehaus, S. Koops, T. Hopp, R. Pöttgen, H.-D. Wiemhöfer, Investigation of the cation valency and conductivity of antimony-substituted ceria, J. Solid State Electrochem. 20 (2016) 2295–2304.
- [28] T. Wu, T. Vegge, H.A. Hansen, Enhanced activity for electrocatalytic H₂ production through cooperative Pr and Bi co-doping of CeO₂ in solid oxide electrolysis cells, J. Catal. 402 (2021) 310–314.
- [29] N. Mazzanti, Ceria-based thin film electrodes for sustainable hydrogen production, Kgs. Lyngby: DTU Energy, 2021. 256 p.
- [30] R.G. Parr, Density functional theory, Ann. Rev. Phys. Chern. 34 (1983) 631–656.
 [31] J.P. Perdew, K. Burke, M. Ernzerhof, Generalized gradient approximation made
- simple, Phys. Rev. Lett. 77 (1996) 3865–3868.
 [32] G. Kresse, J. Furthmüller, Efficient iterative schemes for ab initio total-energy calculations using a plane-wave basis set, Phys. Rev. B. 54 (1996) 11169–11186.
- [33] M. Capdevila-Cortada, M. García-Melchor, N. López, Unraveling the structure sensitivity in methanol conversion on CeO₂: A DFT+U study, J. Catal. 327 (2015) 58–64.
- [34] Y.Q. Su, I.A.W. Filot, J.X. Liu, I. Tranca, E.J.M. Hensen, Charge transport over the defective CeO₂(111) surface, Chem. Mater. 28 (2016) 5652–5658.
- [35] S. Fabris, S.D. Gironcoli, S. Baroni, G. Vicario, G. Balducci, Reply to Comment on "Taming multiple valency with density functionals: A case study of defective ceria", Phys. Rev. B. 72 (2005).
- [36] K. Michel, T.S. Bjørheim, T. Norby, J. Janek, M.T. Elm, Importance of the spinorbit interaction for a consistent theoretical description of small polarons in Pr-doped CeO₂, J. Phys. Chem. C. 124 (2020) 15831–15838.
- [37] G. Henkelman, B.P. Uberuaga, H. Jónsson, Climbing image nudged elastic band method for finding saddle points and minimum energy paths, J. Chem. Phys. 113 (2000) 9901–9904.
- [38] H.-T. Chen, J.-G. Chang, H.-L. Chen, S.-P. Ju, Identifying the O₂ diffusion and reduction mechanisms on CeO₂ electrolyte in solid oxide fuel cells: A DFT+U study, J. Comput. Chem. 30 (2009) 2433–2442.
- [39] D.A. Andersson, S.I. Simak, N.V. Skorodumova, I.A. Abrikosov, B. Johansson, Optimization of ionic conductivity in doped ceria, PNAS. 103 (2006) 3518– 3521.
- [40] P.P. Dholabhai, J.B. Adams, P. Crozier, R. Sharma, Oxygen vacancy migration in ceria and Pr-doped ceria: A DFT+U study, J. Chem. Phys. 132 (2010).
 [41] S. Kozuch, S. Shaik, How to conceptualize catalytic cycles? the energetic Span
- [41] S. Kozuch, S. Shaik, How to conceptualize catalytic cycles? the energetic Span model, Acc. Chem. Res. 44 (2011) 101–110.
- [42] S. Kozuch, A refinement of everyday thinking: The energetic span model for kinetic assessment of catalytic cycles, Wiley Interdiscip. Rev. Comput. Mol. Sci. 2 (2012) 795–815.
- [43] S.J. Hong, A.V. Virkar, Lattice parameters and densities of rare-earth oxide doped ceria electrolytes, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 78 (1995) 433–439.
- [44] D.A. Andersson, S.I. Simak, N.V. Skorodumova, I.A. Abrikosov, B. Johansson, Theoretical study of CeO₂ doped with tetravalent ions, Phys. Rev. B 76 (2007).
- [45] A.K. Lucid, P.R.L. Keating, J.P. Allen, G.W. Watson, Structure and reducibility of CeO₂ doped with trivalent cations, J. Phys. Chem. C. 120 (2016) 23430–23440.
 [46] S. Grieshammer, B.O.H. Grope, J. Koettgen, M. Martin, A combined DFT+U and
- [46] S. Grieshammer, B.O.H. Grope, J. Koettgen, M. Martin, A combined DFT+U and Monte Carlo study on rare earth doped ceria, Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys. 16 (2014) 9974–9986.
- [47] M.J.D. Rushton, A. Chroneos, Impact of uniaxial strain and doping on oxygen diffusion in CeO₂, Sci. Rep. 4 (2014) 6068.
- [48] Q.L. Meng, C. II Lee, T. Ishihara, H. Kaneko, Y. Tamaura, Reactivity of CeO₂based ceramics for solar hydrogen production via a two-step water-splitting cycle with concentrated solar energy, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 36 (2011) 13435–13441.
- [49] M. Ni, M.K.H. Leung, D.Y.C. Leung, Technological development of hydrogen production by solid oxide electrolyzer cell (SOEC), Int. J. Hydrogen Energy. 33 (2008) 2337–2354.
- [50] C. Zhang, C.-J. Li, G. Zhang, X.-J. Ning, C.-X. Li, H. Liao, C. Coddet, Ionic conductivity and its temperature dependence of atmospheric plasma-sprayed yttria stabilized zirconia electrolyte, Mater. Sci. Eng. B. 137 (2007) 24–30.