



Isotopic characterization of vanillin ex glucose by GC-IRMS - New challenge for natural vanilla flavour authentication?

Wilde, Amelie Sina; Frandsen, Henrik Lauritz; Fromberg, Arvid; Smedsgaard, Jørn; Greule, Markus

Published in:
Food Control

Link to article, DOI:
[10.1016/j.foodcont.2019.106735](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2019.106735)

Publication date:
2019

Document Version
Peer reviewed version

[Link back to DTU Orbit](#)

Citation (APA):

Wilde, A. S., Frandsen, H. L., Fromberg, A., Smedsgaard, J., & Greule, M. (2019). Isotopic characterization of vanillin ex glucose by GC-IRMS - New challenge for natural vanilla flavour authentication? *Food Control*, 106, [106735]. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodcont.2019.106735>

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Isotopic Characterization of Vanillin ex Glucose by GC-IRMS - New Challenge for natural vanilla flavour authentication?

Amelie S. Wilde^{1*}, Henrik Lauritz Frandsen¹, Arvid Fromberg¹, Jørn Smedsgaard¹, Markus Greule²

¹ National Food Institute, Technical University of Denmark, 2800 Kgs. Lyngby, Denmark

² Institute of Earth Science, Heidelberg University, 69120 Heidelberg, Germany

*Corresponding author: Amelie Sina Wilde, Research Group for Analytical Food Chemistry, National Food Institute, Technical University of Denmark, Kemitorvet, DK-2800 Kgs. Lyngby, Denmark, E-mail: amsi@food.dtu.dk

Keywords

Authenticity; natural vanilla flavor; biovanillin; ¹³C/¹²C ratio; ²H/¹H ratio; Isotope ratio mass spectrometry

Highlights:

- Carbon and hydrogen isotopic ratio characterisation of vanillin ex glucose
- Database extension of vanilla pods originating from 16 different countries
- Carbon and hydrogen isotopic ratio characterisation of a vanilla hybrid

Abstract

Vanilla flavour is highly vulnerable to economically motivated adulteration as the main component vanillin can be derived by much cheaper production methods than by the extraction from vanilla pods. The $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ ranges for synthetic vanillin from petroleum and C3 plants are depleted in comparison to the reported $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ range for vanillin from vanilla orchids. However, with the invention of new biosynthetic pathways, vanillin overlapping with the characteristic $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ range reported for vanillin from vanilla pods can be produced. Here, we present site-specific analysis by GC-IRMS of stable carbon and hydrogen isotope ratios of vanillin derived from glucose. This is the first time a $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value for biovanillin that is higher compared to vanillin from vanilla pods is reported. The possibility to simulate the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ range of vanillin from vanilla pods by combining vanillin derived from inexpensive sources constitutes an increased risk for fraud being perpetrated while remaining unnoticed.

1 Introduction

Vanilla, known as the “Queen” of spices, is one of the most popular flavours in the world and is widely used in food and perfume industries. *Vanilla* has its origin in Mexico, but it is nowadays cultured in various tropical countries around the equator including Madagascar that supplies more than half of the world production. The genus *Vanilla* belongs to the family *Orchidaceae* that comprises more than 100 species. *Vanilla planifolia* is the orchid with the most economical importance for vanilla production, whereas other species as *Vanilla*

31 *tahitensis* and *Vanilla pompona* represent minor sources and are only cultivated in small scales (Dignum,
32 Kerler, & Verpoorte, 2001). Several hybrids of the different species are known such as the hybrids “Vaitsy”
33 and “Tsy Taitry”, which are combinations of *V. planifolia* and *V.pompona*. Vanilla requires special growth
34 conditions and an elaborate curing procedure (Korthou & Verpoorte, 2007). The global demand for vanillin,
35 the main compound of the vanilla flavour, was 18.700 tons in 2016. Less than 1% of this demand originated
36 from vanilla pods, whereas 99 % of the global volume share of vanillin was of synthetic origin (Grand View
37 Research, 2017b). Nevertheless, the popularity and high demand for the vanilla flavour obtained from vanilla
38 pods make vanilla one of the most expensive spices (Grand View Research, 2017a). The price of vanilla pods
39 (containing 1-2% vanillin) was around US\$ 500/kg in 2017 or even higher for a premium quality (Gelski, 2017),
40 whereas the price for synthetic vanillin is around US\$ 10/kg (Bomgardner, 2016). This price gap obviously
41 constitutes an important cause for economically motivated fraud that involves replacing natural vanillin from
42 vanilla pods by cheaper synthetic vanillin. “Biovanillin” represents a third option to provide vanillin to the
43 market. It is biotechnology-derived vanillin produced from natural raw materials and can be labelled as
44 “natural vanillin” according to the European regulation 1334/2008 (European Parliament and the Council of
45 the European Union, 2008). The labelling of food products as “natural” constitutes a powerful marketing tool.
46 Consumers are often willing to pay a premium price for products that convey naturalness and being a
47 healthier and safer product (Hartmann, Hieke, Taper, & Siegrist, 2018). The most successful strategies are
48 microorganism-based approaches using biotransformation reactions from native or genetically modified
49 fungi, yeast, or bacteria to produce vanillin from structurally similar substrates (Fache, Boutevin, & Caillol,
50 2016). Biotechnology-derived vanillin produced from rice bran/corn (ferulic acid), clove (eugenol), and
51 turmeric (curcumin) have been marketed for more than a decade (Gallage & Lindberg Møller, 2015).
52 Recently, vanillin was synthesised by fermentation from glucose in the yeasts *S. cerevisiae* and
53 *Schizosaccharomyces pombe*, illustrated in **Figure 1** (Hansen et al., 2009; Gallage & Lindberg Møller, 2015).

54 However, the market price for biovanillin is still not competitive with synthetic vanillin. Much attention has
55 been given to cost and yield optimization of biotechnologically produced vanillin in order to gain a
56 competitive market position relative to chemically synthesised vanillin. Among the precursors used for
57 biovanillin production, glucose is the cheapest substrate with an average cost of US\$ 0.30/kg (Gallage &
58 Lindberg Møller, 2015). **Figure 2** summarises all the reported pathways for the production of vanillin that is
59 available in the market or rather planned to be marketed in the near future. As glucose is produced from
60 starch in principle any starch source can be used. However, the most important commercial source of starch
61 is corn with other sources being wheat, potato, tapioca, and rice (Fellows, 2017). Sugar beet and sugar cane
62 could theoretically also be used as glucose sources.

63 Isotope ratio mass spectrometry analysis has been considered as an efficient tool for the authentication of
64 vanillin since the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ -ranges of vanillin from different precursors (petroleum, C3, C4 and CAM plants) differ
65 from each other (Meier-Augenstein, 1999). Since the vanilla plant belongs to the CAM category, the reported
66 delta range found for vanillin extracted from vanilla pods was from -22.2‰ to -14.6‰ (Gassenmeier,
67 Binggeli, Kirsch, & Otv, 2013; Greule et al., 2010). On the other hand, approximately 85% of the synthetic
68 vanillin is produced from the petrochemical precursor guaiacol and the rest is produced from lignin obtained
69 from C3 plants (Bomgardner, 2016). The delta ranges for synthetic vanillin were from
70 -36.2‰ to -24.9‰ (petrochemical) and -28.7‰ to -26.5‰ (lignin), respectively, and thus they can easily be
71 distinguished from natural vanillin of the vanilla pod (Hoffman & Salb, 1979; Culp & Noakes, 1992; Bricout,
72 Fontes, & Merlivat, 1974). However, the stable carbon isotope ratio of the vanillin bulk molecule ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$) as
73 the analytical parameter for determining the origin has some limitations. Synthetic vanillin manipulated with
74 synthetic vanillin enriched in ^{13}C cannot be distinguished from natural vanillin from vanilla pods by the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$
75 value (Krueger & Krueger, 1983). Moreover, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ ranges for biovanillin and synthetic vanillin are
76 overlapping when originating from C3 plants. Finally, vanillin ex ferulic acid derived from corn which is a C4
77 plant has been reported to overlap with vanillin ex vanilla pods (Geißler et al., 2017). It will therefore be of
78 particular interest to investigate the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ range of vanillin ex glucose, as it can also be derived from the C4
79 plant corn.

80 Position-specific analysis in combination with multivariate data analysis has been applied successfully to
81 distinguish vanillin from different sources, even when the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ values are overlapping (Geißler et al., 2017).
82 SNIF-NMR methods (site-specific isotopic fractionation by nuclear magnetic resonance) were applied,
83 however, large sample amounts and long analysis times are required (Guyader et al., 2019). GC-IRMS, which
84 requires much smaller sample amounts delivers the isotopic ratio of the vanillin bulk value and, by applying
85 the 'Zeisel reaction', also provides the stable carbon and hydrogen isotope signature of the methoxy group
86 (Greule et al., 2010; Krueger & Krueger, 1983).

87 The present research investigates biovanillin derived from glucose by GC-IRMS ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$, $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Methoxy}}$,
88 and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$) for the first time. Moreover, the existing database for vanillin from different sources has been
89 extended by natural vanillin from 16 different countries, including the hybrid *Vanilla* $\frac{3}{4}$ *Planifolia* and $\frac{1}{4}$
90 *Pompona* from Costa Rica that, to the best of the authors' knowledge, was not characterised before. The
91 strategy to determine the authenticity of vanillin by GC-IRMS analysis of bulk vanillin combined with the
92 position-specific analysis of the vanillin methoxy group is critically discussed against the background of the
93 challenges that will emerge with the development of new biotechnological production methods of biovanillin
94 in the near future.

95 2 Materials and Methods

96 2.1 Sample collection

97 A total of 78 vanilla pod samples were analysed by GC-IRMS ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$). The samples originate from 16 different
98 countries: Papua New Guinea (*V. planifolia*) (n=4), Mexico (*V. planifolia*) (n=7), Congo (*V. planifolia*) (n=4), Uganda (*V.*
99 *planifolia*) (n=7), New Caledonia (*V. planifolia*) (n=4), Vanuatu (*V. planifolia*) (n=5), Mauritius (*V. Tahitensis*) (n=2), Sri
100 Lanka (*V. planifolia*) (n=6), Madagascar (*V. planifolia*) (n=11), Grand Comores (*V. planifolia*) (n=4), Raiatea (*V. Tahitensis*)
101 (n=4), Cook Islands (*V. Tahitensis*) (n=4), Costa Rica (Hybrid *V. 3/4 Planifolia and 1/4 Pompona*) (n=4), Bora Bora Islands
102 (*V. planifolia*) (n=4), Indonesia (*V. planifolia*) (n=6), and India (*V. planifolia*) (n=2). Of these vanilla pods, seven samples
103 (each from Papua New Guinea, Mexico, Vanuatu, Sri Lanka, Madagascar, and Costa Rica) were selected to isolate vanillin
104 to analyse $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ by GC-IRMS. One biovanillin sample derived from glucose was provided by Professor
105 Birger Lindberg Møller from the Plant Biochemistry Laboratory at the University of Copenhagen and analysed by GC-
106 IRMS ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$, $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$). A detailed overview of the samples investigated in this study is
107 presented in Supplementary Table 1.

108 2.2 Chemicals

109 The following solvents were used for extraction and isolation of vanillin: ethanol, abs. for analysis from
110 Merck, Darmstadt (Germany), ethyl acetate, cyclohexane and dichloromethane (HPLC grade) from Rathburn
111 Chemicals Ltd, Walkerburn (Scotland). The used water was purified with a Milli-Q water purification system
112 from Millipore Corp. (Bedford, MA). The used chemical reagents were obtained from the following
113 commercial sources: anhydrous sodium sulfate and disodium hydrogen phosphate dihydrate from Merck
114 (Darmstadt, Germany), ammonium sulfate from Sigma-Aldrich Co. (St. Louis, USA), and hydriodic acid (55-
115 58%) from Fluka (Buchs, Switzerland).

116 2.2.1 Sample preparation

117 2.2.1.1 Vanillin extraction

118 Approximately 3 g of the vanilla pods were split open. The seeds were scraped out and the rest of the pod
119 was cut into pieces with a length of less than 5 mm. The samples were placed in a closed flask with 4 mL H₂O
120 and 4 mL EtOH and macerated at ambient temperature for approximately 72 h during constant shaking at 60
121 rpm in an overhead shaker (Reax 2) from Heidolph, Germany. Afterwards, the mixture was filtered with a
122 filter paper (Whatman™). A total of 3 mL of the ethanol/water extract was further extracted with 3 mL of
123 ethyl acetate/cyclohexane (1:1) and dried with anhydrous sodium sulfate. The extracts were not diluted
124 before analyses by GC-HTC-IRMS. For GC-C-IRMS analyses, the samples were 1:4 diluted with ethyl
125 acetate/cyclohexane (1:1).

126 **2.2.1.2 Vanillin isolation**

127 The filtrate from the vanillin extraction procedure was used for the isolation of vanillin from the vanilla pods.
128 0.4 g of Na₂HPO₄ and 1.3 g of (NH₄)₂SO₄ per 2 g vanilla pod were added. The mixture was stirred until a clear
129 separation between the aqueous and organic phases was achieved. The organic phase was collected and
130 applied on preparative thin-layer chromatography plates (silica gel matrix with fluorescent indicator, Merck
131 (Germany). Dichloromethane was used as the mobile phase for the chromatographic separation. The vanilla
132 compounds were detected by UV light and was collected by scraping the silica from the plates. The vanillin
133 was extracted from the silica with ethyl acetate in an ultrasound bath for 5 min. The mixture was filtered to
134 remove the silica. The purity of the vanillin was checked by GC-MS. Lastly, ethyl acetate was evaporated. The
135 same sample procedure was also performed with a vanillin standard to exclude isotopic fractionation during
136 the isolation process.

137 **2.2.2 Sample preparation – analysis of vanillin methoxy groups**

138 Analyses of vanillin methoxy groups were conducted as previously described (Greule et al., 2010). 1-2 mg of
139 pure vanillin was used for the carbon analyses, and 4-7 mg was used for the hydrogen analyses.

140 **2.2.3 GC-IRMS Instrumentation**

141 All stable isotope measurements were performed as previously described (Geißler et al., 2017). These
142 measurements were performed using a gas chromatography-combustion/high temperature conversion-
143 isotope ratio mass spectrometry (GC-C/HTC-IRMS) system consisting of an HP 6890 N gas chromatograph
144 (Agilent, Santa Clara, CA, USA) equipped with an A200S autosampler (CTC Analytics, Zwingen, Switzerland),
145 coupled to a DeltaPLUS XL isotope ratio mass spectrometer (ThermoQuest Finnigan, Bremen, Germany) via
146 an oxidation reactor ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$) [ceramic tube (Al₂O₃), length 320 mm, 0.5 mm i.d., with Cu/Ni/Pt wires inside
147 (activated by oxygen), reactor temperature 960 °C] or via a pyrolysis reactor ($\delta^2\text{H}$) [ceramic tube (Al₂O₃),
148 length 320 mm, 0.5 mm i.d., reactor temperature 1450 °C] and a GC Combustion III interface (ThermoQuest
149 Finnigan, Bremen, Germany). A tank of high purity carbon dioxide 4.8 (Kohlendioxid ISO-TOP, Air Liquide,
150 Düsseldorf, Germany) was used as the working reference gas for carbon stable isotope analysis. For hydrogen
151 stable isotope analysis, a tank of high purity hydrogen gas 6.0 (Alphagaz™ 2 H₂, Air Liquide, Düsseldorf,
152 Germany) was used as the working reference gas.

153 Throughout this paper, the conventional ‘delta’ notation is used. $\delta^2\text{H}$ values relative to V-SMOW and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$
154 values relative to V-PDB are defined as:

$$155 \quad \delta^i\text{E} = ((^i\text{R}_{\text{sample}} - ^i\text{R}_{\text{reference}}) / ^i\text{R}_{\text{reference}})$$

156 where i is the mass number of the heavier isotope of the element E, R_{sample} is the respective isotope ratio of
157 the sample and $R_{\text{reference}}$ is the isotope ratio of the relevant internationally recognised reference material. The
158 delta values are multiplied by 1000 and expressed in “per mil” (‰) (Coplen, 2011; Brand, Coplen, Vogl,
159 Rosner, & Prohaska, 2014).

160 **2.2.4 Bulk analysis**

161 For both, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ bulk analysis, 1 μl of dissolved vanillin samples was automatically injected into the GC-
162 C/HTC-IRMS system. Corrections of the vanillin bulk values were made against a vanillin working standard
163 ($\delta^{13}\text{C} = -29.06\text{‰}$, $\delta^2\text{H} = 79.7\text{‰}$) (Greule et al., 2010).

164 **2.2.5 Analysis of methoxy groups**

165 Hydrogen and carbon isotopic signatures of vanillin methoxy groups were measured as CH_3I released upon
166 treatment of vanillin samples with HI as previously described (Greule et al., 2009, 2010). The gas
167 chromatograph was fitted with a ZB-5 ms capillary column (Phenomenex, Torrance, CA, USA) (30 m*0.25 mm
168 i.d., d_f 1.0 mm).

169 The GC conditions for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ analysis were: split injection (split ratio 10:1), injector temperature 200 °C; initial
170 oven temperature at 30 °C for 3.8 min, ramp at 30 °C/min to 100 °C. Helium was used as the carrier gas and
171 the flow rate was 1.8 mL/min. Regarding $\delta^2\text{H}$ analysis, the following GC conditions were employed: split
172 injection (split ratio 4:1), injector temperature 200 °C; initial oven temperature at 30 °C for 7 min, ramp at 40
173 °C/min to 120 °C with a constant helium carrier gas flow of 0.6 mL/min.

174 All $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ values were normalized relative to V-PDB or V-SMOW by a two-point calibration using two
175 CH_3I standards with distinct isotope signatures. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ values of CH_3I were calibrated against
176 international reference substances (NBS-19 (+1.95‰) and NBS-22 (-30.03 ± 0.04‰) for carbon; VSMOW2 (0
177 ± 0.3‰) and SLAP2 (-427.5 ± 0.3‰) for hydrogen using TC/EA-IRMS (elemental analyser-isotopic ratio mass
178 spectrometer, IsoLab, Max Planck Institute for Biogeochemistry, Jena, Germany). The calibrated $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values
179 vs. V-PDB for the two CH_3I working standards were $-70.04 \pm 0.13\text{‰}$ ($n = 5$, 1σ) and $-60.72 \pm 0.05\text{‰}$ ($n = 7$, 1
180 σ). The calibrated $\delta^2\text{H}$ values vs. V-SMOW were $-173.0 \pm 1.5\text{‰}$ ($n = 9$, 1σ) and $-66.2 \pm 1.2\text{‰}$ ($n = 8$, 1σ). CH_3I
181 standard measurements were performed after every fifth sample injection.

182 3 Results and discussion

183 Analysis of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ value of vanillin derived from glucose

184 For vanillin ex glucose, a $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ value of -12.5 ‰ was determined. The botanical origin of the glucose is not
185 known in this case. However, a $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ value of -11 ‰ was reported for glucose obtained from C4 plants,
186 while a value of about -25 ‰ was reported for glucose derived from C3 plants (Meier-Augenstein, 1999). It
187 is therefore likely that the here analysed vanillin originates from glucose that was obtained from a C4 plant,
188 for example, corn. It is the first time a $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value for biovanillin is reported that is higher compared to vanillin
189 from vanilla pods.

190 More vanillin samples ex glucose obtained from known sources (e.g., rice, potato, or corn) should be
191 investigated to fill the current data gap about vanillin from these sources. So far, highly priced ^{13}C enriched
192 vanillin is required for adulteration of synthetic vanillin in order to match the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ range for vanillin from
193 vanilla pods. A cheap source of vanillin enriched in ^{13}C will make it easier to simulate the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ value of
194 vanillin from vanilla pods by mixing vanillin from the respective sources, which can increase the risk of fraud
195 being perpetrated while remaining unnoticed by the analysis of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ values. However, several studies on
196 purified vanillin have demonstrated that additional information about the $\delta^2\text{H}$ values as well as position-
197 specific isotope analysis of stable hydrogen and carbon enables the distinction of vanillin obtained from
198 different precursors even if the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ ranges overlap (Geißler et al., 2017; Tenailleau, Lancelin, Robins, &
199 Akoka, 2004; Guyader et al., 2019).

200 $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ analyses of bulk vanillin and vanillin methoxy groups

201 Previous studies have reported the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ values of bulk vanillin and vanillin methoxy groups from
202 different vanillin samples, showing a clustering of the samples from the same source (Geißler et al., 2017;
203 Greule et al., 2010). These literature data have been combined with the acquired data here in order to
204 compare vanillin ex glucose with known vanillin products from different sources. **Figure 3** shows the 2D plot
205 of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ vs. $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ values of the combined data, illustrating that vanillin ex glucose (red spot) is clearly
206 distinguished from vanillin derived from all other sources. **Figure 3** further displays that the values of the
207 vanillin ex vanilla pods lies between the values of vanillin ex eugenol (or guaiacol) and those of vanillin ex
208 glucose. It can thus be inferred that a combination of these sources can lead to an imitation of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and
209 the $\delta^2\text{H}$ bulk values of vanillin ex vanilla pods.

210 The data acquired in this study (**Figure 3**) represent the results of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ bulk values of vanillin ex
211 vanilla pods from 16 different countries. This additional data assert that it is not possible to reliably separate

212 authentic vanillin ex vanilla pods from vanillin ex ferulic acid (corn) by solely analysing the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$.
213 The measured values of vanillin from vanilla pods in our work lie even closer to the values of vanillin ex ferulic
214 acid (corn), in agreement with the previous findings in the literature (Geißler et al., 2017). Considering the
215 hybrid *Vanilla* $\frac{3}{4}$ *Planifolia* and $\frac{1}{4}$ *Pompona*, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ bulk values of the three vanillin samples from
216 this hybrid (green circles) are found to overlap with those of the samples from the species *Vanilla Planifolia*
217 (**Figure 3**).

218 Furthermore, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ data of the methoxy groups of vanillin ex glucose and vanillin extracted from
219 seven vanilla pods have been compared with the data from existing studies (**Figure 4**). It can again be
220 observed in the plot of $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ that the samples of vanillin derived from vanilla pods lie
221 between vanillin samples ex eugenol (or guaiacol) and vanillin ex glucose. This means that by an appropriate
222 mixture, not only the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ bulk values might be imitated, but also the stable isotope values of vanillin
223 methoxy groups.

224 The vanillin samples from different precursor groups were distinguished either in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ vs. $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ plot
225 or rather in the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ vs. $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ plot (Geißler et al., 2017). However, it must be taken into
226 consideration that before using the four parameters ($\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Methoxy}}$, $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$) for reliable
227 prediction of an unknown sample, a representative sample set covering the natural variability of each group
228 is required. The $\delta^2\text{H}$ -value of a sample is linked to the climatic conditions and geographical characteristics of
229 the place where the sample has grown (Smith & Ziegler, 1990; International Atomic Energy Agency, 2019).
230 Therefore, $\delta^2\text{H}$ -values with a high variability must be expected for plants such as corn that can be cultivated
231 in widespread areas, (CGIAR Research Program on Maize, 2016).

232 A further approach to assess the origin of vanillin samples is to plot the $\delta^2\text{H}$ values of bulk vanillin against
233 the $\delta^2\text{H}$ values of the vanillin methoxy groups (**Figure 5**). This correlation might benefit from the fact that the
234 $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ values of the plant material are highly depleted compared to the $\delta^2\text{H}$ values of the source water as
235 a result of a large uniform biosynthetic fractionation (Keppler & Hamilton, 2008; Anhäuser, Greule, Polag,
236 Bowen, & Keppler, 2017). However, the $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ value more or less reflects the stable hydrogen isotopic
237 signature of the source water (Sternberg, 1988; (Keppler et al., 2007). Thus, the correlation
238 between $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ represents this biosynthetic fractionation in good approximation. As this
239 fractionation has been shown to be plant species-specific (Greule, Rossmann, Schmidt, Mosandl, & Keppler,
240 2015), varying natural sources serving as vanillin precursors like corn, rice, or potatoes might have different
241 biosynthetic fractionations between source water or $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$. **Figure 5** shows a clear separation
242 of the samples of vanillin ex ferulic acid (corn) from the samples of vanillin ex vanilla pods which might be

243 influenced by different biosynthetic fractionations as stated before. On the other hand, while all samples of
244 vanillin ex pods show an average fractionation between $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ of -124‰, both samples of
245 vanillin ex ferulic acid (corn) fractionate by only -26 and -22‰, respectively (**Figure 5**). This discrepancy is not
246 explainable up to now but can be probably attributed to processes during the extraction of ferulic acid from
247 corn and/or biosynthesis of vanillin by fermentative bioconversion. It is highly unlikely that $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ of corn
248 will not exhibit a large biosynthetic fractionation to source water or $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$, although this has not been
249 analysed yet. However, the differentiation of vanillin ex vanilla pods from vanillin ex ferulic acid (corn) based
250 on the ratio of $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ to $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ must be confirmed by extending the respective sample sets. Moreover,
251 the correlation $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}/\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ might have the potential to separate vanillin ex glucose from authentic
252 vanillin samples due to the most negative $\delta^2\text{H}$ values in both, bulk and methoxy group **Figure 5**. Nevertheless,
253 it must be emphasized again that it is mandatory to analyse more vanillin ex glucose samples for a reliable
254 assessment.

255 Another analytical technique for the authentication of vanillin is the determination of ^{13}C and ^2H -SNIF-NMR
256 isotopic fingerprints. Recently, vanillin ex ferulic acid (corn) has also been included in a database where
257 vanillin from different precursors (ferulic acid (rice), eugenol, curcumin, lignin, guaiacol, vanilla pods) were
258 investigated (Guyader et al., 2019). The ^{13}C isotopic profiles allowed a promising distinction of all of the
259 precursor groups. However, a proximity between vanillin ex ferulic acid from corn and vanillin ex vanilla pods
260 was observed, whereas these two groups were better separated by the ^2H isotopic profiles. This is in
261 accordance with the GC-IRMS results where the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ of vanillin ex ferulic acid (corn) and ex
262 vanilla pods are overlapping, while a separation can be observed when comparing the values for $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Bulk}}$ and
263 $\delta^2\text{H}_{\text{Methoxy}}$ of both groups. One of the aims of the SNIF-NMR analysis is to reduce the needed sample amount
264 which might open the possibility to analyse vanillin isolated from food products by SNIF-NMR (Guyader et
265 al., 2019). In contrast to that, only a small amount of vanillin is needed for the analysis by GC-IRMS in
266 combination with the Zeisel method. This method is therefore more appropriate to analyse quite small
267 amounts of vanillin which are usually incorporated in processed food products.

268 Anyway, biovanillin ex glucose is expected to enter the market. The results of this study for vanillin ex glucose
269 are alarming, as cheap vanillin enriched in ^{13}C opens an easy route to fraudulently simulate the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ range
270 of vanillin from vanilla pods. This is particularly relevant as the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ value is often the parameter used to
271 determine the authenticity of vanillin incorporated in food products (Schipilliti, Bonaccorsi, & Mondello,
272 2016; Lamprecht & Blochberger, 2009; Bononi, Quaglia, & Tateo, 2015).

273

274 **4 Conclusion**

275 Comparing stable hydrogen and carbon isotope composition of vanillin ex glucose with the current database
276 highlights that i) there is an urgent need for an isotopic characterisation of vanillin ex glucose based on a
277 sufficient sample set, ii) the mix of synthetic/biosynthetic vanillin with vanillin ex glucose can provide a cost-
278 efficient opportunity to fraudulently simulate the $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{Bulk}}$ range for vanillin from vanilla pods, and iii) there is
279 an increased risk that biosynthetic vanillin will be sold as vanillin from vanilla pods when used as an ingredient
280 in processed foods like ice cream. It was shown that the analysed vanillin ex glucose sample can be
281 distinguished from vanillin of other sources by GC-IRMS. Moreover, data from vanillin ex glucose (obtained
282 from different precursors like corn, potato, and rice) should be integrated into existing SNIF-NMR-databases,
283 since this technique also delivers promising results for the distinction of vanillin of different precursors. The
284 intention of this study is to encourage the extension of the database for biovanillin from different precursors,
285 especially as vanillin ex glucose and vanillin ex ferulic acid from corn have the potential to complicate the
286 authentication of natural vanilla flavour from vanilla beans in the future.

287 **5 Acknowledgement**

288 The authors would like to thank Professor Birger Lindberg Møller, Plant Biochemistry Laboratory at the
289 University of Copenhagen for supplying vanillin derived from glucose for this project.

290 **Conflict of interest statement**

291 The authors declare no conflict of interest.

292

293 6 References

- 294 Anhäuser, T., Greule, M., Polag, D., Bowen, G. J., & Keppler, F. (2017). Mean annual temperatures of mid-
295 latitude regions derived from $\delta^2\text{H}$ values of wood lignin methoxyl groups and its implications for
296 paleoclimate studies. *Science of the Total Environment*, 574, 1276–1282.
297 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.07.189>
- 298 Bomgardner, M. M. (2016). The problem with vanilla. *Chemical and Engineering News*, 94(36), 38–42.
299 <https://doi.org/10.1021/cen-09436-cover>
- 300 Bononi, M., Quaglia, G., & Tateo, F. (2015). Easy Extraction Method to Evaluate $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ Vanillin by Liquid
301 Chromatography-Isotopic Ratio Mass Spectrometry in Chocolate Bars and Chocolate Snack Foods.
302 *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 63(19), 4777–4781.
303 <https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.5b02136>
- 304 Brand, W. A., Coplen, T. B., Vogl, J., Rosner, M., & Prohaska, T. (2014). Assessment of international
305 reference materials for isotope-ratio analysis (IUPAC Technical Report). *Pure and Applied Chemistry*,
306 86(3), 425–467. <https://doi.org/10.1515/pac-2013-1023>
- 307 Bricout, J., Fontes, J.-C., & Merlivat, L. (1974). Detection of Synthetic Vanillin in Vanilla Extracts by Isotopic
308 Analysis. *J. Assoc. Off. Anal. Chem.*, 1(57), 713–715.
- 309 CGIAR Research Program on Maize. (2016). Challenges and opportunities - Maize production. Retrieved
310 February 11, 2019, from <https://maize.org/challenges-and-opportunities/>
- 311 Coplen, T. B. (2011). Guidelines and recommended terms for expression of stable-isotope-ratio and gas-
312 ratio measurement results. *Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry*, 25(17), 2538–2560.
313 <https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.5129>
- 314 Culp, R. A., & Noakes, J. E. (1992). Determination of Synthetic Components in Flavors by
315 Deuterium/Hydrogen Isotopic Ratios. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 40(10), 1892–1897.
316 <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf00022a033>
- 317 Dignum, M. J. W., Kerler, J., & Verpoorte, R. (2001). Vanilla Production: Technological, Chemical, and
318 Biosynthetic Aspects. *Food Reviews International*, 17(2), 119–120. <https://doi.org/10.1081/FRI-100000269>
- 320 European Parliament and the Council of the European Union. (2008). Regulation (EC) No 1334/2008.
321 *Official Journal of the European Union*, L 354/34(1334), 34–50. Retrieved from <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/?uri=celex:32008R1334>
- 323 Fache, M., Boutevin, B., & Caillol, S. (2016). Vanillin Production from Lignin and Its Use as a Renewable
324 Chemical. *ACS Sustainable Chemistry and Engineering*, 4(1), 35–46.
325 <https://doi.org/10.1021/acssuschemeng.5b01344>
- 326 Fellows, P. J. (2017). Properties of food and principles of processing. In *Food processing technology :
327 principles and practice* (4th ed., pp. 3–200). Woodhead Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-100522-4.00001-8>
- 329 Gallage, N. J., & Lindberg Møller, B. (2015). Vanillin-bioconversion and bioengineering of the most popular
330 plant flavor and its de novo biosynthesis in the vanilla orchid. *Molecular Plant*, 8(1), 40–57.
331 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.molp.2014.11.008>

- 332 Gassenmeier, K., Binggeli, E., Kirsch, T., & Otiv, S. (2013). Modulation of the $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ ratio of vanillin from
333 vanilla beans during curing. *Flavour and Fragrance Journal*, 28(1), 25–29.
334 <https://doi.org/10.1002/ffj.3122>
- 335 Geißler, K., Greule, M., Schäfer, U., Hans, J., Geißler, T., Meier, L., ... Krammer, G. (2017). Vanilla
336 authenticity control by DNA barcoding and isotope data aggregation. *Flavour and Fragrance Journal*,
337 32(4), 228–237. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ffj.3379>
- 338 Gelski, J. (2017). Vanilla prices shoot up, near \$500 per kilogram. Retrieved January 18, 2019, from
339 <https://www.foodbusinessnews.net/articles/8953-vanilla-prices-shoot-up-near-500-per-kilogram>
- 340 Grand View Research. (2017a). Vanillin Market Analysis. Retrieved November 1, 2018, from
341 <https://www.grandviewresearch.com/industry-analysis/vanillin-market>
- 342 Grand View Research. (2017b). Vanillin Market Size Worth \$724.5 Million By 2025- Growth Rate: 7.0%.
343 Retrieved January 24, 2018, from [https://www.grandviewresearch.com/press-release/global-vanillin-](https://www.grandviewresearch.com/press-release/global-vanillin-market)
344 [market](https://www.grandviewresearch.com/press-release/global-vanillin-market)
- 345 Greule, M., Mosandl, A., Hamilton, J. T. g., & Keppler, F. (2009). A simple rapid method to precisely
346 determine $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ ratios of plant methoxyl groups. *Rapid Communications in Mass Spectrometry* :
347 *RCM*, 23(11), 1710–1714. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rcm.4057>
- 348 Greule, M., Rossmann, A., Schmidt, H. L., Mosandl, A., & Keppler, F. (2015). A stable isotope approach to
349 assessing water loss in fruits and vegetables during storage. *Journal of Agricultural and Food*
350 *Chemistry*, 63(7), 1974–1981. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf505192p>
- 351 Greule, M., Tumino, L. D., Kronewald, T., Hener, U., Schleucher, J., Mosandl, A., & Keppler, F. (2010).
352 Improved rapid authentication of vanillin using $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ values. *European Food Research and*
353 *Technology*, 231(6), 933–941. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00217-010-1346-z>
- 354 Guyader, S., Thomas, F., Jamin, E., Grand, M., Akoka, S., Silvestre, V., & Remaud, G. S. (2019). Combination
355 of ^{13}C and ^2H SNIF-NMR isotopic fingerprints of vanillin to control its precursors. *Flavour and*
356 *Fragrance Journal*, 34(2), 133–144. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ffj.3486>
- 357 Hansen, A. M. S., Fromberg, A., & Frandsen, H. L. (2014). Authenticity and traceability of vanilla flavors by
358 analysis of stable isotopes of carbon and hydrogen. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 62(42),
359 10326–10331. <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf503055k>
- 360 Hansen, E. H., Møller, B. L., Kock, G. R., Bünner, C. M., Kristensen, C., Jensen, O. R., ... Hansen, J. (2009). De
361 novo biosynthesis of Vanillin in fission yeast (*Schizosaccharomyces pombe*) and baker's yeast
362 (*Saccharomyces cerevisiae*). *Applied and Environmental Microbiology*, 75(9), 2765–2774.
363 <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.02681-08>
- 364 Hartmann, C., Hieke, S., Taper, C., & Siegrist, M. (2018). European consumer healthiness evaluation of
365 'Free-from' labelled food products. *Food Quality and Preference*, 68, 377–388.
366 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodqual.2017.12.009>
- 367 Hoffman, P., & Salb, M. (1979). Isolation and stable isotope ratio analysis of vanillin. *Journal of Agricultural*
368 *and Food Chemistry*, 27(2), 352–355. Retrieved from
369 <http://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/jf60222a036>
- 370 International Atomic Energy Agency. (2019). RCWIP (Regionalized Cluster-Based Water Isotope Prediction)
371 Model – gridded precipitation $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ | $\delta^2\text{H}$ | $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^2\text{H}$ isoscape data. Retrieved March 7, 2019,

372 from <http://www.iaea.org/water>

373 Keppler, F., & Hamilton, J. (2008). Tracing the geographical origin of early potato tubers using stable
374 hydrogen isotope ratios of methoxyl groups. *Isotopes in Environmental and Health Studies*, 44(4),
375 337–347. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10256010802507383>

376 Keppler, F., Harper, D. B., Kalin, R. M., Meier-Augenstein, W., Farmer, N., Davis, S., ... Hamilton, J. T. G.
377 (2007). Stable hydrogen isotope ratios of lignin methoxyl groups as a paleoclimate proxy and
378 constraint of the geographical origin of wood. *New Phytologist*, 176(3), 600–609.
379 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2007.02213.x>

380 Korthou, H., & Verpoorte, R. (2007). Vanilla. In R. G. Berger (Ed.), *Flavours and Fragrances: Chemistry,*
381 *Bioprocessing and Sustainability* (pp. 203–217). Berlin Heidelberg: Springer.
382 <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-540-49339-6>

383 Krueger, D. A., & Krueger, H. W. (1983). Carbon isotopes in vanillin and the detection of falsified natural
384 vanillin. *Section Title: Food and Feed Chemistry*, 31(6), 1265–1268.
385 <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf00120a030>

386 Lamprecht, G., & Blochberger, K. (2009). Protocol for isolation of vanillin from ice cream and yoghurt to
387 confirm the vanilla beans origin by ¹³C-EA-IRMS. *Food Chemistry*, 114(3), 1130–1134.
388 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2008.10.071>

389 Meier-Augenstein, W. (1999). Applied gas chromatography coupled to isotope ratio mass spectrometry.
390 *Journal of Chromatography A*, 842(1–2), 351–371. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0021-9673\(98\)01057-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0021-9673(98)01057-7)

391 Schipilliti, L., Bonaccorsi, I. L., & Mondello, L. (2016). Characterization of natural vanilla flavour in foodstuff
392 by HS-SPME and GC-C-IRMS. *Flavour and Fragrance Journal*, 32(2), 85–91.
393 <https://doi.org/10.1002/ffj.3364>

394 Smith, B. N., & Ziegler, H. (1990). Isotopic Fractionation of Hydrogen in Plants. *Botanica Acta*, 103(4), 335–
395 342. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1438-8677.1990.tb00171.x>

396 Sternberg, L. da S. L. S. (1988). D/H ratios of environmental water recorded by D/H ratios of plant lipids.
397 *Nature*, 333(6168), 59–61.

398 Tenailleau, E., Lancelin, P., Robins, R. J., & Akoka, S. (2004). NMR approach to the quantification of
399 nonstatistical ¹³C distribution in natural products: Vanillin. *Analytical Chemistry*, 76(13), 3818–3825.
400 <https://doi.org/10.1021/ac0496998>

401